Re-Forging the 'Age of Iron'

Part I: The Tenth Century as the End of the Ancient World?

John Howe*
Texas Tech University

Abstract

The tenth century, once dismissed as an unpleasant 'Age of Iron', now receives increased attention as an important age of transition. Historians are attempting to understand how it fits into the broader narrative of Western Civilization. Some have identified it as the last act of the post-Roman world. They identify its economy and social structures as Late Antique – at least until a 'feudal revolution' around the year 1000 suddenly swept them away. More professional soldiers based in new forts are said to mark the sudden advent of a new, more chaotic order. Church and state, rebuilding together after the invasions and civil wars of the late ninth century, self-consciously attempted, with varying degrees of success, to model themselves on Roman precedents. This movement culminated in the reign of Emperor Otto III (983–1002), who relocated the capital to Rome and dedicated himself 'to renew the ancient customs of the Romans'. The points of tangency cited between the Later Roman world and the tenth century are impressive, but a definitive judgement also requires that the century's novel aspects be considered.

The Dark Tenth Century

When Renaissance humanists embraced an idealized Classical past, they spurned their medieval predecessors. They labeled everything between themselves and Rome the 'Middle Ages' (the '*Medium Aevum*'), a dark age characterized by barbarisms such as 'Gothic' architecture. Even today the term 'medieval' remains sinister.[1] Most of its eras and areas ultimately found champions who discovered in them origins of Western Civilization, ages of faith, births of nations, reawakenings, renaissances, and other wonderful things. The tenth century, however, took a long time to get adopted, and up until the middle of the 20th, it remained deep in shadow, one of the darkest corners of the dark ages.

Acording to Cardinal Caesar Baronius (d. 1607) in his *Annales Ecclesiastici*, the tenth century was an 'Age of Iron'. Its disorderly papal politics particularly shocked this leader of the Catholic Reformation.[2] It was the first century in Christian history without a pope acclaimed a saint. Worse yet, it witnessed a 'papal pornocracy' at whose nadir, claimed Liudprand of Cremona (d. 972), lay the reign of Pope John XII (955–962), who allegedly turned the Lateran into a brothel and put such fear into the hearts of female pilgrims that they hesitated 'to visit the thresholds of the apostles for the sake of prayer, since they heard that …several women, married, widowed, and virgins were forcefully raped there' (Liudprand's stories are so titillating that historians cannot resist telling them, despite the fact that he was a paid propagandist for John's enemies).[3] Nor did chronic attacks from Vikings, Muslims, and Magyars help the century's reputation.

The 'Age of Iron' label stuck.[4] In this alleged dark age, the lights really did seem to go out, or at least flicker badly. All over Europe, scholars have claimed, universal chronicles temporarily disappeared,[5] poetic production was reduced,[6] charters became less abundant,[7]

and written legislation dropped off precipitously.[8] The medieval biographical tradition has such a striking lacuna between 920 and 960 that it is used to divide classical and early medieval traditions from new developments in the High Middle Ages – even the papal biographies in the *Liber Pontificalis* become sketchy after the reign of Stephen V (885–891).[9] And after Stephen's pontificate canonists stopped adding contemporary papal letters into their collections, a practice not reversed until the reign of Leo IX (1049–1054).[10] Little wonder then that, in the traditional grand narrative of Western history, the tenth century appears as a painful interlude between the Carolingian world and the revival of high medieval Europe.

The Tenth Century Rediscovered

In the late 20th century, opinions began to change. Compare, for example, the first edition of the *Cambridge Medieval History* (1911–1936), where the tenth century is described in several chapters at the end of *Vol. III: Germany and the Western Empire* (1922), with the *New Cambridge Medieval History* (1995–2005), where all of *Volume III: c. 900–c. 1024* (1999) is devoted to a 'long tenth century', a period 'crucial in the formation of Europe'.[11] The tenth century is now the subject of conferences and works of analysis.[12] Some scholars have even hailed it as a 'renaissance'.[13] Its major chronicles are now appearing in a spate of English translations.[14]

The new popularity is due to converging historiographical trends. One is an expansion of the evidentiary base medieval historians use: after World War I, researchers associated with the journal *Annales* championed a new way of doing history that would incorporate charters, lives of the saints, liturgical works, archeological evidence, and all sorts of other materials that historians had often failed to exploit systematically – some of these 'new' sources offer illuminating perspectives on the tenth century.[15] Increased concern with material culture undercut the negative stereotypes: in the words of Lord Kenneth Clarke's famous series on civilization, 'Historians usually consider the tenth century almost as dark and barbarous as the seventh. That is because they look at it from the point of view of political history and the written word. If we read what Ruskin called the book of its art, we get a very different impression, because, contrary to all expectation, the tenth century produced work as splendid and technically skillful, even as delicate, as any other age'.[16] Also important has been the development of women's studies – the tenth century had powerful women, perhaps because their personal connections and roles in court ritual had more importance in a world where institutional structures were still embryonic.[17] Most important, however, may have been an expansion of the mental map of Europe: traditional medieval history privileged England, France, Germany, and Italy (after World War I even Germany sometimes got marginalized), but now 'Europe' seems larger. Spain, after Franco, became a lively field for international medieval research. The fall of the Iron Curtain brought Slavic and Magyar nations into Western Europe. Scandinavian states became part of the Common Market. This wider Europe pays more attention to the tenth century because then communities north, south, east, and west of the Frankish core were beginning to create their own identities.

Where Does the Tenth Century Fit?

New interest in the tenth century has led to new debates. So long as the tenth century could be dismissed as a cultural dead zone, scholars were not compelled to debate its significance, but if it has its own identity (identities?), its place in the grand narrative

of Western Civilization becomes more problematic. Where does it fit? Scholars have come to very different conclusions. For some, the tenth century marks the end of the ancient world, a last burst and implosion of Late Antiquity. For others, it is the birth of the High Middle Ages, and, more grandly, the beginning of the Ancien Régime that would dominate Europe until the French Revolution and would remain influential long afterwards. Yet others see it as 'Francia II', the sequel, a new flowering of the economic, political, and cultural achievements made by the Franks under the Carolingians.

This present study discusses the tenth century as the end of the ancient world. Scholars analyzing its economic and social structrures, its military developments, and its ecclesaistical and political Roman restorations have described it as the final flowering of Late Antiquity. In a subsequent survey in *History Compass*, however, I will be examining perspectives that emphasize the century's novelties rather than its continuities with the ancient world. The conflicting perspectives reflect not only diverse features of the tenth-century but also opposing presuppositions about the essential features of Western Civilization that scholars bring with them to its study. Debates about the tenth century continue as scholars attempt to find the model that illuminates best and obscures least.

The Ancient World Marches Forward

Up until a century ago, no educated modern person would have thought to link the civilization of ancient Rome to that of tenth-century Western Europe. According to Edward Gibbon, the Roman Empire ('the most civilized portion of mankind') fell because of 'the triumph of barbarism and religion'; he viewed the tenth century in the Latin West as 'an age of ignorance' characterized by triumphant barbarians.[18] After World War I, however, Rome would not stay 'fallen'. Its legions were led into new chronological territory by the great Belgian historian Henri Pirenne (d. 1935), who claimed that Rome's economic and intellectual civilization continued even after the deposition of its last western emperor in 476, that the 'truly essential features of … Roman culture' maintained a 'Mediterranean unity' persisting until the rise of Islam; that the West fell back onto its own northern European Germanic resources after Islamic piracy closed the Mediterranean, so that 'without Mohammed, Charlemagne would have been inconceivable'.[19] Pirenne's so-called 'Romania' brought the Roman world into the eighth century. Then as critics of the 'Pirenne thesis' attempted to ascertain whether the 'Roman' Mediterranean had really been disrupted by Islam, they discovered a Charlemagne who looked less like the hairy German warrior immortalized in the bronze statue in front of Notre Dame and more like the laurel-wreathed 'Carolus Imperator Augustus' on the faux Roman coins he minted, an emperor closely connected to the Mediterranean world who lived in a Late-Roman-style provincial imperial palace complex at Aachen.[20] When did 'Romania' actually end? That question seems especially disquieting because Peter Brown, the great rehabilitator of the sophisticated world of Late Antiquity, has delighted over the years in warning audiences that 'Late Antiquity is later than you think'.[21]

Not everyone is sanguine about Late Antiquity's expansion.[22] If Rome's academic legions want to lay claim to the entire early medieval West, they need to identify a grand strategy, an underlying mission lending vitality to what had appeared to be simply the detritus of a fallen civilization. Rome's final mission, it is now alleged, was to change barbarians into Romans or at least into Rome-friendly nations This perspective, long implicit in the sweeping theses of Roman Catholic apologists such as the sociologist Christopher Dawson,[23] is now explicit in Walter Goffart's survey of 'Rome's Final Conquest: The Barbarians', which is presented here in *History Compass*.[24] These barbarians,

no longer the ferocious alien 'other', have now metamorphosed into pillars of the old Roman system, client peoples essential to Roman society whose regularization had always been an on-going task.

Note that if the master narrative of post-Roman Western history becomes the Romanization of new peoples, then this story reaches its logical conclusion when, at the end of the tenth century, the Scandinavians, Slavs, and Magyars were all drawn firmly into the Roman orbit. This expansion has even been suggested as the real catalyst for the break up of Mediterranean unity – Pirenne's major theme – since late ninth- and tenth-century ecclesiastical rivalries over Eastern Europe seriously exacerbated differences between Latin and Greek Christians.[25] Locating the division between the old world and the new around the year 1000 harmonizes with Europe's newly expanded historiographical consciousness because at that time the nations to the north and east were simultaneously converting to Christianity, forming proto-states, and experiencing increasing Frankish cultural hegemony.

A problem with making Rome's civilizing mission the master narrative is that it was not completely successful – I am writing here in English, not Latin. The partial failure has been explained by one of the many European intellectuals displaced by the Nazis, Peter Munz (d. 2007), who, after observing New Zealanders and Maoris attempting to accommodate each other in his new homeland, came to the conclusion that early medieval history 'is essentially a history of the gradual dissolution of tribes', a dynamic that could inspire Charlemagne but also thwart him inasmuch as it created both chaos and alternative structures that could get in the way of a restored Roman order. According to Munz, the period between the Roman Empire and the developed feudal monarchies resembles modern European colonization and decolonization, both in the destruction of indigenous cultures and in the unpredictable cultural syntheses that followed.[26] Moreover, a goal partially attained can be a dead end. Achieved goals are obsolete, their inadequacies glaringly obvious. Scholars who see the tenth century as the end of the ancient world in the Latin West often find themselves simultaneously elucidating both the 'Romanness' of the century and its disjunctures with the following age.

Did the Ancient Economic Order Survive until a Millennial 'Feudal Revolution'?

Historians who place the tenth century in the ancient world usually point first to its economic and social order. Their arguments are complex. Some consensus exists about economic organization before and after the Early Middle Ages. In the hierarchically organized Later Roman Empire, centers attempted to dominate peripheries (not always with great success). The countryside featured large, self-sufficient estates, depending to a greater or lesser extent on unfree labor. Economic transactions, even labor agreements, came to rely more on barter and gift, less on money. The resulting economy was increasingly static, but had the virtues of stability and predictability. This differs greatly from the world of the High Middle Ages, where dramatic rural and urban demographic growth were associated with expanding local and international markets. Peasants cultivated more and more land. Agricultural slavery had disappeared, and slavery itself was rare except for domestic slaves in maritime regions, most often females. The new rural economy was a tight patchwork of castles, territorial lordships, villages, parishes, and towns. What is debated is how Europe managed to move from one system to the other. Medieval historians traditionally postulated a long, slow transition, and treated the records surviving from the Carolingian Empire as an economic 'snapshot' taken at some point near the middle of a linear development. But now a new scenario is on the table.

Could the ancient rural economy have continued on in the Latin west – despite multiple crises, fluctuations, and local anomalies – right up until the very end of the tenth century, and then undergone a cataclysmic metamorphosis, an economic and social paradigm shift that created the world of the High Middle Ages? Part of the inspiration for this theory comes from Marxist economics which equate production in the ancient world with a slave economy and in the medieval world with a feudal economy, a distinction that left Marxist scholars uncomfortable about the half millennium of early medieval history whose 'mode of production' was not obviously either.[27] More than a half century ago, Georges Duby, studying the Mâconnais (the well documented region around the monastery of Cluny), described a rapid structural transformation around the turn of the millennium when lesser nobles and knights usurped power; in the 1960s, he labeled this a 'feudal revolution' (a 'révolution féodale').[28] French scholars ran with this model.[29] Lively debate ensued.[30] Scholars have identified transEuropean and even worldwide manifestations.[31] A related way to conceptualize rapid shifts to new forms of seigneurial exploitation is 'encastellation' (an awkward anglicization of the Italian 'encastellamento'), the construction of vast numbers of fortified centers throughout the interior of Europe, a process that began in a major way in the tenth century and burgeoned in the 11th and 12th. Although the castles and fortified villages originally had military purposes, they fostered greater control by lords as they encouraged people to move from dispersed households and hamlets into more concentrated settlements.[32] Violence emanating from these castles is said to have brought down the old rural order. In fact, scholars describing a 'feudal revolution' almost always document their cases with anecdotal reports of violence,[33] even though some skeptics question whether it might not also have been possible to collect similar tales of woe from other time periods such as the ninth century, or whether the clergymen reporting 'violence' were always disinterested witnesses, or whether an alleged increase in accounts of violence might reflect changes in the processes of reporting rather than in the underlying conduct.[34]

In the film *The Wild One* (1954), Marlon Brando, challenged to name what he was rebelling against, asked 'What have you got?' If there were a 'feudal revolution', to what was it opposed? What have the *mutationistes* got? Their grand vision is compelling enough in the abstract. They argue that up through the tenth century the old order in the countryside still included a 'public sphere' that in theory, although not always in practice, represented an overarching ideal of order and public good. The rebels were lesser lords, castellans, and knights who within a couple of generations completely privatized the old public order, grabbed governmental powers for themselves, and forced all elements of society to accede to their demands. To formulate this model too clearly: tenth-century lordship would have been exercised publicly by traditional public officials for the public good, eleventh-century lordship privately by usurpers for self-aggrandizement. But what demonstrates this? Government property, the old imperial *fisc* acquired by post-Roman kings, offers no help as an index, since chunks of lands and revenues were continually alienated throughout the Early Middle Ages, and since, as Carolingian monarchs became weaker during the ninth century, the counts who were their administrators tended to silently absorb public property into their own holdings.[35] Even in Charlemagne's day, governmental offices were often inherited. Elite expectations of gifts and 'fiefs' as payments for services do not constitute any distinctive change inasmuch as Carolingian governmental 'officials' had always been 'aristocrats first, royal agents second'.[36]

One possible marker is the *placitum*, the public tribunal run by the count, which became increasingly rare in some parts of Europe after the tenth century.[37] Related to this breakdown of higher justice would have been the *seigneurie banale*, lesser lords who acquired the judicial power of command (the *ban*), and used such banal lordship to

homogenize all peasant farmers – slaves, non-slave tenants, and even free men within their legal jurisdictions – into an amorphous class of dependent serfs.[38] But would the breakdown of a somewhat centralized court system, one more distinguished for social compromise than for abstract justice, have been a sufficient reason for a rapid social and political structural shift?

The proof for such a shift is said to be the decline of slavery. It is claimed that tenth-century Europe was still a 'slave society'.[39] Recent studies have certainly expanded knowledge of early medieval slavery in the Latin West, demonstrating not only its importance but also some surprising geographical and chronological variations.[40] But in the tenth century, leaving aside those owned by Vikings and Muslims, slaves are not very conspicuous.[41] Thus those who claim that tenth-century Europe was a 'slave society' find it necessary to argue that just as in today's 'capitalist societies' only a small minority of people may actually control the means of production and dominate markets, but yet are still able to impose their social values on all who aspire to such advantages so also in a 'slave society' even rare slavery could still be a determinative social structure if those people who were slaveholders thereby gained a superior social status that non-slaveholders would want to acquire.[42] This argument, however, derives much of its force from verbal slippage: 'slavery' is technically a legal state of non-freedom, not necessarily connected to systems of 'plantation slavery' such as those known in the ancient world and in the antebellum American South; to make slavery the major marker of the survival (or absence) of the ancient economy puts a heavy burden on a purely legal construct that, in practice, might not have greatly differentiated the day-to-day lives of slaves from those of their neighbors, other peasant farmers who might also owe produce and labor to the very same lords. The disappearance of agricultural slavery in the High Middle Ages might reflect its irrelevance rather than prove that oppressive overlords had suddenly revolutionized society by trapping slaves and all other peasant farmers in an arbitrary net of serfdom.

Mutations in a Roman Military Order?

Tenth-century nations resembled Rome by employing professional military forces. Although in the days of the Republic a Roman citizen army had been able to conquer much of the Mediterranean coast, professionals took over once the demands of ruling a world empire became too great. German nations also formerly had citizen armies consisting of all free able-bodied males of appropriate age. Scholars increasingly doubt, however, that the ideal of 'a nation in arms' remained practical over the centuries, even among the Anglo-Saxons and the Lombards whose laws and texts sometimes seem to presuppose it.[43] More typical was the way Charlemagne assembled his forces for battle: he normally summoned his own and his counts' military households (the well-trained special forces mobilized by warlords since late antiquity); for a larger army he called up a select levy from free men of property, perhaps supplemented by allies or mercenaries; only for emergency defense in border areas did he employ mass mobilization.[44] His most important troops were heavily armored professional soldiers. Although they had horses for transport, whether or not they actually fought on horseback has been the subject of a long historiographical debate: it had been claimed that heavily armored cavalrymen dominated battlefields ever since the Battle of Adrianople (378); then Lynn White Jr. linked the ascendancy of the knight to technological changes in the Carolingian era such as the adoption of the stirrup and 'mounted shock combat' (attack with the lance held at rest against the body, so that it struck its target with the combined force of horse and rider); after White's thesis was overthrown by evidence indicating that Carolingian forces usually

still fought on foot, scholars continued to search for a post-Carolingian 'military revolution' that would mark the knight's definitive ascent, perhaps in Germany in the tenth century.[45] Today some scholars question whether mounted knights ever dominated early medieval battlefields.[46] What can be affirmed is that armored professional soldiers gained importance in the tenth century thanks to the spread of improved military technology, more affordable iron armor, and, most important of all, the ability of soldiers based in newly constructed castles to harass all the countryside within a half day's ride. Popular militias, on the other hand, except when defending well-planned fortified positions, were increasingly useless against these military professionals.[47]

This shifting balance had social consequences. On one hand, the transition to more professional military forces made society more 'Roman', and in places where overlords could actually control their vassals more hierarchical. Yet the old Carolingian order's relatively small ruling elite – the ruler's relatives, friends, and officeholders – now had to come to terms with more numerous and increasingly powerful professional fighters, some possessing their own fortified bases. So did peasant farmers. The result could be fundamental changes in political and social relationships. As champions of 'feudal mutation' describe this process:

> From the very heart of the "primitive" peasantry came those who allowed its domestication. Here too we can see more clearly today that those not-so-chivalrous knights ... were not all of noble family, far from it. The vast majority of these henchmen, these "fist men," were [sic] born of the decomposition, the "kulakization," of ancient country society. In order to be "higher" than the others, they agreed to serve, thus making possible the final victory of the warrior households over the peasant neighborhoods. Once the fundamental character of this movement was determined, there was little room for chronological fluctuations: by the decades around the year 1000 the western European world had fundamentally changed.[48]

A Roman Ecclesiastical and Political Order?

The institutions of Church and state in the tenth century were consciously modeled on Roman precedent, perhaps more closely than in any earlier or later medieval century. Today's scholars usually prefer to treat Church and state as separate institutions, but no sharp distinctions were drawn here by Constantine, Charlemagne, and the unbroken line of Roman emperors who still ruled out of Constantinople. In theory, rulers held their powers from the Lord, and, as his vassals, were obliged to safeguard religious interests – to protect, promote, and enrich the Lord's Church. The first Carolingian kings and emperors used ecclesiastical recognition and ceremony to justify their usurpation, but based their actual power primarily on their own resources and on their ability to unite local aristocratic factions. Later Carolingian rulers and their non-Carolingian successors, weakened by factional wars and invasions, depended more and more upon the institutional Church. The tenth century saw increasingly elaborate coronation ceremonies. Kings had thrones in great churches. As itinerant rulers, they routinely sought hospitality at their major churches and monasteries, and they had a vested interest in ensuring that these way stations could provide it.[49] They exercised control by patronage and by promoting their own candidates for ecclesiastical offices.[50]

Educated churchmen thought in Roman terms and helped spread Roman ideals. In Ottonian Germany, the imperial clergy led by Archbishop Bruno of Cologne (953–65), the chancellor and half brother of Otto I, developed styles of conduct and public service that introduced courtly behavior to Germanic warlords.[51] The court promoted a Ciceronian

philosophy of public service.[52] Prince bishops, clean-shaven in the Roman style and wearing clerical vestments derived from Rome, helped make hirsute German warlords obsolete.[53] In the absence of effective state institutions, churchmen and rulers utilized Rome-oriented ritual and symbolism to domesticate unruly nobles.[54]

Public classicism was not limited to German nobles: around the millennium some French lords – including the dukes of Normandy, the counts of Anjou, and the dukes of Aquitaine – were also distinguished for Roman ceremonies and affectations.[55] Simple knights, however, would need more time, perhaps until the 12th century, to acquire any coherent chivalric courtly ideology.[56] A self-conscious classical revival in tenth-century schools has been claimed as the start of the renaissance of which the famed 'Renaissance of the Twelfth Century' was the conclusion.[57] In regard to the more practical arts of Rome, it is noteworthy that Vitruvius' *De Architectura* surives in a half dozen or more tenth-century copies, more than from any other pre-Renaissance century.[58]

Tenth-century clerics self-consciously evoked Rome by incorporating into their new churches elements taken from ancient buildings (*spolia*) and by modeling their churches on those built by Constantine in Rome and Jerusalem.[59] Yet clerics did not rely very much upon the pope's direct administrative authority. The bishop of Rome was an important symbolic figure who, as the leader of the West's most prestigious church, could be called upon to validate ecclesiastical arrangements throughout the Latin West, but the surviving tenth-century papal letters do not demonstrate consistent Roman leadership or bureaucratic sophistication.[60]

Otto III and Roman Restoration

The most cited example of Roman influence on tenth-century politics is the career of Otto III (king 983–1002, emperor 996–1002), who received much recent scholarly attention during the millennial anniversaries of his reign.[61] His grandfather Otto I (936–973), after acquiring an imperial crown in Rome in 962, attempted to affirm his status by arranging for his son Otto II to marry a Byzantine princess. Empress Theophanou brought Greek art, learning, and personnel to the West. Otto III, her son, was raised to be an old-style emperor. His tutor, Gerbert of Rheims, was not modest about the program:

> Ours, ours is the Roman Empire. Italy, fertile in fruits, Lorraine and Germany, fertile in men, offer their resources, and even the strong kingdoms of the Slavs are not lacking to us. Our August emperor of the Romans art thou, Caesar, who, sprung from the noblest blood of the Greeks, surpass the Greeks in empire and govern the Romans by hereditary right, but both you surpass in genius and eloquence.[62]

How dedicated Gerbert was to the restoration of Rome is indicated by the name he chose when Otto III helped arrange his election as pope, Sylvester II, evoking Sylvester I, the pope during Constantine's reign. Otto III adopted an imperial lead seal that boasted of 'The Renewal of the Roman Empire' ('*Renovatio imperii Romanorum*'). His aim, a contemporary claimed, was not just to renew the Empire but also 'to renew the ancient customs of the Romans, now mostly obliterated'.[63] He moved his court to Rome, took up residence on the Palatine hill, and awarded Greek and Latin titles to his followers. Questions about the novelty, coherence, sincerity, and audience of this imperial initiative continue to elicit lively scholarly debate.[64]

Otto III symbolizes not only the desire to restore the Roman Empire but also its impracticality. While residing in Rome, he found the Germans difficult to govern and the Romans impossible. Soon he was forced to leave the city, and later, after a brief

eremitical interlude, he died while preparing to besiege it. He was only 22. The princess bride he had requested from Constantinople arrived in Italy too late and was sent back home. '*Renovatio imperii Romanorum*' had failed. In the Byzantine East, an autocrat aided by a long-established bureaucracy could still rule in a late Roman manner over an autarchic, fragmented populace; in the Latin West, a ruler without developed bureaucratic apparatus was confronted by congeries of peoples and territories, nobles with their own military households, powerful lineages, social classes with strong internal horizontal links, and cities and confraternities developing their own new power bases.[65] So great were the obstacles to Roman-style rule that one is tempted to interpret tenth-century Romanophile ideology as a poignant nostalgia for an ideal world order that people vaguely recognized was slipping away, much like the affection of 19th-century Americans for the simple country life depicted in Currier & Ives prints or the fascination of 20th-century Americans with the cowboys and Indians of the 'Westerns'.[66]

Conclusion: The Tenth Century as the End of the Ancient World?

Historical periods are artificial constructs. No one woke up the end of the tenth century and recognized that the ancient world had come to a close. It was once believed that people at the start of the year 1000 expected to wake up to the imminent end of the whole world, but the millennialist traditions involved, as illuminated by recent scholarly debates about the 'terrors of the year 1000', turn out to be much more diffuse.[67] The flow of time was seamless.

Amateur and professional historians create historical periodization in order to orient themselves and their audiences to major changes over time. Separating history into 'ages' is pedagogically useful insofar as it situates past events in gross chronological frameworks and makes it easier to recognize relationships and developments. Yet there is a perpetual need to balance the benefits gained against the harms inherent in oversimplification.

Thanks to impressive academic studies over the last generation, Late Antiquity has come into its own. Scholars have illuminated its rich intellectual life, its impressive Christian culture, and its continuing, though much transformed, economic, political, and social systems. The Roman Empire is now 'transformed', not 'fallen'. But, if there were no clearly demarcated fall of the Roman Empire, then when did Roman civilization become so irrevocably transformed that it can no longer function effectively as an explanatory device? Advancing units of Rome's academic legions have been attempting to claim for themselves all of the Early Middle Ages, and to imagine the tenth century as the ancient world's last curtain call, Late Antiquity's final bow before it yielded to the High Middle Ages, the first stage of a recognizably modern world. Aspects of this case are convincing; the continuities and connections cited are impressive.

Yet not everyone is prepared to consign the tenth century to the ancient world. Scholars adopting very different perspectives have seen it as the start, or even as the second stage, of a whole new medieval world. Their arguments also deserve a hearing and will be presented in 'Reforging the Age of Iron, Part II' to follow in *History Compass*.

Short Biography

John Howe studies the ecclesiastical and social history of tenth- through 12th-century Europe and is now at work on a survey of *The Revival of the Latin Church: The 'Pre-Gregorian' Reform*. He is the author of *Church Reform and Social Change in Eleventh-Century Central Italy: Dominic of Sora and His Patrons* (1997, recipient of the American Catholic Historical

Association's John Gilmary Shea Prize in 1998) and editor (with Michael Wolfe) of *Inventing Medieval Landscapes: Senses of Place in Western Europe* (2002). His contributions to historical journals in many countries include hagiographical source criticism, inventories for the German Institute in Paris's project on the *Sources hagiographiques de la Gaule*, studies highlighting ecclesiastical and social changes in central Italy, and historiographical reviews. He earned his doctoral degree from the University of California at Los Angeles (1979). He has taught medieval history at Texas Tech University since 1981, with breaks that include service as a Fellow of the School of Historical Studies at the Institute of Advanced Study, Princeton (2001) and as a Senior Research Associate at the Erasmus Institute at the University of Notre Dame (2003–04).

Notes

* Correspondence: Department of History, PO Box 41013, Texas Tech University, Lubbock, Texas 79409-1013, United States. Email: john.howe@ttu.edu.

[1] M. Bull, *Thinking Medieval: An Introduction to the Study of the Middle Ages* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), 7–41; T. Reuter, 'Medieval: Another Tyrannous Construct?', *The Medieval History Journal*, 1 (1998): 25–45, repr. in his *Medieval Polities and Modern Mentalities*, J. L. Nelson (ed.) (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 19–37.

[2] C. Baronius, *Annales Ecclesiastici*, in A. Theiner (ed.), 37 vols. (Bar-le-Duc: L. Guerin, 1864–83), vol. 15, 467. His concerns are sketched in G. Arnaldi, 'Mito e realtà del secolo X romano e papale', in *Il secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19–25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), vol. 1, 25–53.

[3] Liudprand of Cremona, *Historia Ottonis*, in P. Squatriti (trans.), *The Complete Works of Liudprand of Cremona*, Medieval Texts in Translation (Washington, DC: The Catholic University of America Press, 2007), 222. On Liudprand's point of view, see P. Buc, 'Italian Hussies and German Matrons: Liudprand of Cremona on Dynastic Legitimacy', *Frühmittelalterliche Studien*, 29 (1995): 207–25; and 'Writing Ottonian Hegemony: Good Rituals and Bad Rituals in Liudprand of Cremona', *Majestas*, 4 (1996), 3–38.

[4] H. Zimmermann, *Das Dunkle Jahrhundert: Ein historisches Porträt* (Graz: Verlag Styria, 1971), 15–21, traces the afterlife of Baronius's condemnation.

[5] K. Leyser, 'Ritual, Ceremony, and Gesture: Ottonian Germany', in Reuter (ed.), *Communications and Power in Medieval Europe*, 2 vols. (London: Hambledon Press, 1994), vol. 1, 189–213, esp. 193–94; M. Sot, 'L'historiographie latine dans l'Europe de l'An Mil', in P. Bonnassie and P. Toubert (eds.), *Hommes et sociétés dans l'Europe de l'an mil* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 2004), 389–405.

[6] J.-Y. Tilliette, 'La poésie métrique latine: Ateliers et genres', in D. Iogna-Prat and J. C. Picard (eds.), *Religion et culture autour de l'an Mil. Royaume capétien et Lotharingie: Actes du Colloque Hugues Capet 987–1987, la France de l'an Mil, Auxerre, 26 et 27 juin 1987 – Metz, 11 et 12 septembre 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1990), 103–09, esp. 108.

[7] M. Zimmermann, 'Écrire en l'An Mil', in Bonnassie and Toubert (eds.), *Hommes et sociétés*, 351–78, esp. 371–78.

[8] Reuter, 'Introduction: Reading the Tenth Century', in *The New Cambridge Medieval History* [hereafter *NCMH*], 8 vols. (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1995–2005), vol. 3, 1–24, esp. 6–7.

[9] A. M. Piazzoni, 'Biografie dei papi del secolo X nelle continuazioni del *Liber pontificalis*', *Mittellateinisches Jahrbuch*, 24/25 (1991): 369–82; W. Berschin, *Biographie und Epochenstil im lateinischen Mittelalter*, 4 vols. in 5 (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann Verlag, 1986–2001), vol. 4(1), 5–59, esp. 5–7.

[10] D. Jasper, 'Prefatory Remarks' and 'Conclusion', in Jasper and Fuhrmann (eds.), *Papal Letters in the Early Middle Ages*, History of Medieval Canon Law (Washington, DC: The Catholic University of America Press, 2001), 4 and 132–33.

[11] Compare J. P. Whitney (ed.), *The Cambridge Medieval History. Vol. 3: Germany and the Western Empire* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1922) with Reuter (ed.), *NCMH. Vol. 3: c. 900–c. 1024* (Ibid., 1999).

[12] E. Duckett, *Death and Life in the Tenth Century* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, 1967); D. Parsons (ed.), *Tenth-Century Studies: Essays in Commemoration of the Millennium of the Council of Winchester and Regularis Concordia* (London: Phillimore, 1975); Zimmermann, *Das Dunkle Jahrhundert*; H. Fichtenau, *Lebensordnungen des 10. Jahrhunderts: Studien über Denkart und Existenz im einstigen Karolingerreich*, 2 vols., Monographien zur Geschichte des Mittelalters, vol. 30(1–2) (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann Verlag, 1984); in 1 vol. without the original notes in P. J. Geary (ed. and trans.), *Living in the Tenth Century: Mentalities and Social Orders* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991); *Il Secolo di ferro*; and J. Henning (ed.), *Europa im 10. Jahrhundert: Archäologie einer Aufbruchszeit, Internationale Tagung in Vorbereitung der Ausstellung "Otto der Große, Magdeburg und Europa"* (Mainz am Rhein: Verlag Philipp von Zabern, 2002). The turn of the millennium prompted a whole subgenre of studies focused on the year 1000, among them M. Bourin and B. H. Rosenwein (eds.), *L'An Mil en 2000*, in *Médiévales* [dedicated issue], 37 (1999): 1–114; C. Smith

(ed.), *Before and after the End of Time: Architecture and the Year 1000* (New York: Harvard Design School with George Braziller, 2000); P. Urbańczyk (ed.), *Europe around the Year 1000* (Warsaw: Polish Academy of Sciences Institute of Archaeology and Ethnology, 2001); C. Carozzi et H. Taviani-Carozzi (eds.), *Année mille, an mil* (Aix-en-Provence: Publications de l'Université de Provence, 2002); P. Magdalino (ed.), *Byzantium in the Year 1000*, The Medieval Mediterranean, vol. 45 (Leiden: Brill, 2003); N. Hiscock (ed.), *The White Mantle of Churches: Architecture, Liturgy, and Art around the Millennium*, International Medieval Research Art History, vol. 10 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003); J. Heitzman and W. Schenkluhn (eds.), *The World in the Year 1000* (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 2004); Bonnassie and Toubert (eds.), *Hommes et sociétés*. This list of books on the year 1000 would be even longer if it included local studies and research on the terrors of the millennium.

[13] R. S. Lopez, 'Still Another Renaissance?', *American Historical Review*, 57 (1951): 1–21; L. White Jr., et al., 'Symposium on the Tenth Century', *Medievalia et Humanistica*, 9 (1955): 1–29; Lopez, *The Tenth Century: How Dark the Dark Ages?* Source Problems in World Civilization (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1959); and P. Riché, 'La "Renaissance" intellectuelle du Xᵉ siècle en Occident', *Cahiers d'histoire*, 21 (1976): 27–42, repr. *Instruction et vie religieuse dans le Haut Moyen Age*, Collected Studies, vol. 139 (London: Variorum Reprints, 1981) [same pagination]. Local tenth-century renaissances have been discovered in the monastic revival in England, as in D. Knowles, *The Monastic Order in England* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1940), 32; in an urban renaissance in northwest France, as in L. Musset, 'La renaissance urbaine des Xᵉ et XIᵉ siècles dans l'ouest de la France: Problèmes et hypothèses de travail', in *Études de civilisation médiévale, IXᵉ–XIIᵉ siècles: Mélanges offerts à Edmond-René Labande à l'occasion de son départ à la retraite et du XXᵉ anniversaire du C. É.S.C.M.* (Poitiers: C.É.S.C.M, 1974), 563–75, repr. in his *Nordica et Normannica: Recueil d'études sur la Scandinavie ancienne et médiévale, les expéditions des Vikings et la fondation de la Normandie*, Studia nordica, 1 (Paris: Société des études nordiques, 1997); and in Ottonian art, as in C. R. Dodwell, *Painting in Europe, 800 to 1200* (Baltimore: Penguin Books, 1972), 45–74, though Dodwell later abandoned this terminology in *The Pictorial Arts of the West, 800–1200* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1993), 123–56.

[14] For examples, S. MacLean (trans.), *History and Politics in Late Carolingian and Ottonian Europe: The Chronicle of Regino of Prüm and Adalbert of Magdeburg* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2009); S. Fanning and B. S. Bachrach (trans.), *The Annals of Flodoard of Reims, 919–966*, Readings in Medieval Civilizations and Cultures, vol. 9 (Peterborough, ON: Broadview Press, 2004); Squatriti (trans.), *The Complete Works of Liudprand*; S. Gilsdorf (trans.), *Queenship and Sanctity: The 'Lives' of Mathilda and the 'Epitaph' of Adelheid* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2004); E. Christiansen (trans.), *Dudo of St. Quentin: History of the Normans* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 1998); D. A. Warner (trans.), *Ottonian Germany: The Chronicon of Thietmar of Merseburg*, Manchester Medieval Sources Series (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001); J. France (ed. and trans.), *Rodulfi Glabri, Historiarum Libri Quinque/Rodulfus Glaber: The Five Books of the Histories*, Oxford Medieval Texts (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989).

[15] On the sources for the history of the tenth century, see Reuter, 'Introduction: Reading the Tenth Century', *NCMH*, 3 (1999): 1–24.

[16] K. Clark, *Civilization: A Personal View* (London: BBC, 1969), 24 and 29.

[17] For an overview of 'themes and similarities', see P. Stafford, 'Powerful Women in the Early Middle Ages: Queens and Abbesses', in P. Linehan and J. Nelson (eds.), *The Medieval World* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 398–415. On conspicuous tenth-century women such as Theophanou, Adelaide, Hrotswitha, Mathilda, and Ilduara, see A. Davids (ed.), *The Empress Theophano: Byzantium and the West at the Turn of the First Millennium* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1995); E. Eickhoff, *Theophanu und der König: Otto III. und seine Welt* (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 1996); P. Corbet, M. Goullet, and Iogna-Prat (eds.), *Adélaïde de Bourgogne: Genése et représentations d'une sainteté impériale. Actes du colloque international du Centre d'études médiévales-UMR 5594, Auxerre, 10 et 11 décembre 1999* (Paris: Comité des travaux historiques et scientifiques, 2002); Gilsdorf (ed.), *Queenship*; P. R. Brown, L. A. McMillin, and K. M. Wilson (eds.), *Hrotsvit of Gandersheim* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004); M. del Carmen Pallares Méndez, *Ilduara, una aristócrata del siglo X*, 2nd edn. (A Coruña: Edicios do Castro, 2004). Corbet, *Les saints ottoniens: Sainteté dynastique, sainteté royale et sainteté féminine autour de l'An Mil*, Beihefte zu Francia, vol. 15 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke Verlag, 1986), analyzes the Ottonian dynasty's six family saints, five of whom were women.

[18] Most famously in E. Gibbon, *Decline* i, lv, lvi, lxxi, in *The Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, ed. J. B. Bury, 3 vols. (New York: Heritage Press, 1946), vol. 1, 1; vol. 3, 1946–49, 1964, and 2431.

[19] H. Pirenne, *Medieval Cities: Their Origins and the Revival of Trade*, trans. F. D. Halsey (1925, repr. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1958), 3–32; Pirenne, *Mohammed and Charlemagne*, trans. B. Miall (1939, repr. London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 2008), esp. 234 and 284. On Pirenne's subsequent influence, see R. Hodges, 'Henri Pirenne and the Question of Demand in the Sixth Century', and P. Delogu, 'Reading Pirenne Again', in Hodges and W. Bowden (eds.), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 3 (Leiden: Brill, 1998), 2–14 and 15–40.

[20] R. E. Sullivan, 'The Carolingian Age: Reflections on Its Place in the History of the Middle Ages', *Speculum*, 64 (1989): 267–306, esp. 281–85, argues for Carolingian continuity with the Late Antique world. An indication of the widespread acceptance this view enjoys is that G. W. Bowersock, P. Brown, and O. Grabar (eds.), *Late Antiquity: A Guide to the Postclassical World* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1999), ix, are able to assume, without feeling compelled to offer any justification, that Late Antiquity extends to 800.

[21] Brown helped establish an expanded Late Antiquity with a definitive textbook, *The World of Late Antiquity, AD 150-750* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971). He later adopted an even longer perspective in *The Rise of Western Christendom: Triumph and Diversity, A.D. 200–1000*, 2nd edn. (Oxford: Blackwell, 2003).

[22] For hesitations about this extension of Late Antiquity, see J. H. W. G. Liebeschuetz, *Decline and Fall of the Roman City* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 369–416; P. Heather, *The Fall of the Roman Empire: A New History of Rome and the Barbarians* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), 436–39; B. Ward-Perkins, *The Fall of Rome and the End of Civilization* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005), 163–85; and G. Halsall, *Barbarian Migrations and the Roman West, 376–568*, Cambridge Medieval Textbooks (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 19–22.

[23] C. Dawson, *The Making of Europe: An Introduction to the History of European Unity* (London: Sheed & Ward, 1948); and *Religion and the Rise of Western Culture* (London: Sheed and Ward, 1950).

[24] W. Goffart, 'Rome's Final Conquest: The Barbarians', *History Compass*, 6/3 (2008): 855–883, culminates a body of work on Roman continuity that includes his *Barbarians and Romans, A.D. 418–584: The Techniques of Accommodation* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980); and *Barbarian Tides: The Migration Age and the Later Roman Empire* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006). Note also J. Durliat, *Les finances publiques de Dioclétien aux Carolingiens (284–889)* (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke, 1990). On the issues involved see W. Liebeschütz, 'Cities, Taxes, and the Accommodation of the Barbarians: The Theories of Durliat and Goffart', in W. Pohl (ed.), *Kingdoms of the Empire: The Integration of Barbarians in Late Antiquity* (Leiden: Brill, 1997), 135–51.

[25] C. R. Bowlus, 'Mitteleuropa: The Making of Europe between Byzantium and the Latin West, ca. 800–1025', in C. Chazelle and F. Lifshitz (eds.), *Paradigms and Methods in Early Medieval Studies* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), 185–202. J. Shepherd, 'Conversion and Regimes Compared: The Rus' and the Poles, ca. 1000', in F. Curta (ed.), *East Central & Eastern Europe in the Early Middle Ages* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005), 254–82, offers tangential support for Bowlus' model.

[26] P. Munz, 'Medieval History in Australasia, or the End of the Ancient World', *Historical Studies, Australia and New Zealand*, 11 (1963): 1–17, esp. 3; 'Early European History and African Anthropology', *The New Zealand Journal of History*, 10 (1976): 37–50.

[27] C. Wickham, 'The Other Transition: From the Ancient World to Feudalism', *Past & Present*, 103 (1984): 3–36, esp. 3–8 and 29–33, analyzes (and improves) Marxist historiography on the early medieval economy.

[28] G. Duby, *La société aux XI et XII siècles dans la région mâconnaise* (Paris: A. Colin, 1953); Duby, *The Three Orders: Feudal Society Imagined*, trans. A. Goldhammer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980), 147–66.

[29] R. Fossier, *Enfance de l'Europe: X–XII siècle. Aspects économiques et sociaux*, 2 vols. (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1982), vol. 1, 288–601; J.-P. Poly and E. Bournazel, *The Feudal Transformation, 900–1200*, trans. C. Higgit (New York: Holmes & Meier, 1991); R. Le Jan, 'Le Royaume franc vers 900: Un pouvoir en mutation?' in P. Baudouin (ed.), *Les fondations scandinaves en Occident et les débuts du duché de Normandie: Colloque de Cerisy-la-Salle (25–29 septembre 2002)* (Caen: Publications du CRAHM, 2005), 83–95, esp. 91.

[30] The French consensus on the feudal revolution was questioned in D. Barthélemy, 'La mutation féodale a-t-elle eu lieu? (Note critique)', *Annales: Économies, sociétés, civilisations*, 47 (1992): 767–77, lightly revised and repr. in his *La Mutation de l'an mil a-t-elle eu lieu? Servage et chevalerie dans la France des X et XI siècles* (Paris: Fayard, 1997), 13–28. In response came Bisson, 'The "Feudal Revolution"', *Past & Present*, 142 (1994): 6–42, and an ensuing debate on 'The "Feudal Revolution"', by Barthélemy, S. D. White, Reuter, and Wickham, in *Past & Present*, 152 (1996): 196–223 and 155 (1997): 177–208 [Reuter's contribution repr. in his *Medieval Polities*, 72–88]. Further updates on the debate can be found in C. Lauranson-Rosaz, 'Le débat sur la "mutation féodale": État de la question', in Urbańczyk (ed.), *Europe around the Year 1000*, 11–40; and in Barthélemy's *The Serf, the Knight, and the Historian*, trans. G. R. Edwards (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2009), which is largely a translation of his *La Mutation de l'an mil*, but one where he has substituted for his initial essay a new 'Revisiting the "Feudal Revolution" of the Year 1000' (1–11) and added a postscript on 'New Perspectives on France around the Year 1000' (302–13).

[31] For the spread of the 'feudal revolution' throughout Europe, see T. N. Bisson, *The Crisis of the Twelfth Century: Power, Lordship, and the Origins of European Government* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009), 63. For feudal revolutions throughout the world, see R. J. Barendse, 'The Feudal Mutation: Military and Economic Transformations of the Ethnosphere in the Tenth to Thirteenth Centuries', *Journal of World History*, 14 (2003): 503–29.

[32] P. Toubert, *Dalla terra ai castelli: Paesaggio, agricoltura e poteri nell'Italia medioevale* (Turin: G. Einaudi, 1995); J. Howe, *Church Reform and Social Change in Eleventh-Century Italy: Dominic of Sora and His Patrons* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 10–14; M. Barceló and Toubert (eds.), *L'Incastellamento: Actes des rencontres de Gérone (26–27 novembre 1992) et de Rome (5–7 mai 1994)*, Collection de l'École française de Rome, vol. 241 (Rome: EFR, 1998). Fossier, 'Rural Economy and Country Life', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 27–63, esp. 47–48. On the connection of encastellation to coercive violence, see Bisson, *The Crisis of the Twelfth Century*, 41–49.

[33] Bisson, 'Feudal Revolution', 12–21; S. D. White, 'Debate: The "Feudal Revolution" (II)', *Past & Present*, 152 (1996): 205–23, esp. 205–06; Bisson, *Crisis of the Twelfth Century*, 21 and 41–62.

[34] Barthélemy, 'Debate: The 'Feudal Revolution' (I)', *Past & Present*, 152 (1996): 196–205, esp. 199–201; S. White, *Ibid.*, 205–07; Barthélemy, *The Serf, the Knight*, 3–11; Geary, 'Monastic Memory and the Mutation of the Year Thousand', in S. Farmer and B. H. Rosenwein (eds.), *Monks and Nuns, Saints and Outcasts: Religion in Medieval*

Society. Essays in Honor of Lester K. Little (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2000), 19–36; R. E. Barton, *Lordship in the County of Maine, c. 890–1160* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 2004), 146–73; Barthélemy, *Chevaliers et miracles: La violence et le sacré dans la société féodale* (Paris: Colin, 2004), 3–4.

[35] On the continuity of the Roman fisc into the Carolingian era, see Durliat, *Les finances publiques,* esp. 287–90; and B. S. Bachrach, 'Are They Not Like Us? The Carolingian Fisc in Military Perspective', in Chazelle and Lifshitz (eds.), *Paradigms and Methods,* 119–133.

[36] Nelson, 'Kingship and Royal Government', in *NCMH,* vol. 2 (1995), 383–430, esp. 412; M. Innes, *An Introduction to Early Medieval Europe, 400–900: The Sword, The Plough, and the Book* (London: Routledge 2007), 439–46.

[37] Duby used the breakdown of comital justice to demonstrate the decline of public order in the Mâconnais, and his arguments were taken up by, among others, P. Bonnassie, *From Slavery to Feudalism in South-Western Europe,* trans. J. Birrell, Past and Present Publications (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1991), 102, 107–19, and 186–87; Bisson, 'Feudal Revolution', 9–12; and Wickham, 'Debate: The 'Feudal Revolution' (IV)', *Past & Present,* 155 (1997): 196–208, esp. 203–05. Duby's evidence for judicial discontinuity, however, is systematically deconstructed in S. D. White, 'Tenth-Century Courts at Mâcon and the Perils of Structuralist History: Re-Reading Burgundian Judicial Institutions', in W. C. Brown and P. Górecki (eds.), *Conflict in Medieval Europe: Changing Perspectives on Society and Culture* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2003), 37–68; Bonassie's evidence is reinterpreted in J. Bowman, *Shifting Landmarks: Property, Proof, and Dispute in Catalonia around the Year 1000* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2004). Brown and Górecki, 'What Conflict Means: The Making of Medieval Conflict Studies in the United States, 1970–2000', in Brown and Górecki (eds.), *Conflict in Medieval Europe,* 1–35, esp. 26–33, question whether traditional legal categories are even the proper conceptual framework to use when describing tenth-century 'dispute resolution'.

[38] As the French jargon indicates, the *banale seigneurie* model, whatever universal claims have been made for it, is rooted in French local conditions. Perhaps the best attempt to relate it to other tenth-century types of territorial lordship is C. Violante, 'La signoria rurale nel secolo X: Proposte tipologiche', in *Il Secolo di ferro,* vol. 1, 329–89.

[39] G. Duby and R. Mandrou, *Histoire de la civilisation française,* 2 vols. (Paris: A. Colin, 1958), 15; Bonnassie, *From Slavery to Feudalism,* 32–37; G. Bois, *The Transformation of the Year One Thousand: The Village of Lournand from Antiquity to Feudalism,* trans. Birrell (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1992), 13–33.

[40] Medieval slavery fascinated M. Bloch (d. 1944), one of the founding *Annalistes.* Later research proceeds from his posthumously published and often reprinted essay on 'How and Why Ancient Slavery Came to an End', in *Slavery and Serfdom in the Middle Ages: Selected Essays by Marc Bloch,* trans. W. Beer (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975), 1–31. Subsequent research is discussed in Bonassie, 'The Survival and Extinction of the Slave System in the Early Medieval West (Fourth to Eleventh Centuries)', in *From Slavery to Feudalism,* 1–59; particularly grand claims about its role in international trade are made by M. McCormick, *Origins of the European Economy: Communications and Commerce, A.D. 300–900* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 758–77. Regional studies include R. M. Karras, *Slavery and Society in Medieval Scandinavia* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988); D. A. E. Pelteret, *Slavery in Early Mediaeval England: From the Reign of Alfred until the Twelfth Century* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 1995); S. A. Epstein, *Speaking of Slavery: Color, Ethnicity, and Human Bondage in Italy* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2001), emphasizing slavery in later periods; and C. L. Hammer, *A Large-Scale Slave Society of the Early Middle Ages: Slaves and Their Families in Early Medieval Bavaria* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2002); and several studies on Scandinavian slavery in P. Hernaes and T. Iversen (eds.), *Slavery across Time and Space: Studies in Slavery in Medieval Europe and Africa,* Trondheim Studies in History, vol. 38 (Trondheim: NTRNU Department of History, 2002).

[41] In Italy, a decline of slavery beginning before the tenth century is documented in G. Luzzatto, *I servi nelle grandi proprietà ecclesiastiche italiane dei secoli IX e X* (Senigallia: Società tipografica Marchigiana, 1909), repr. in *Dai servi della gleba agli albori del capitalismo: Saggi del storia economica* (Bari: Laterza, 1966), 1–177. In England, where Viking settlement ought to have promoted slavery, Pelteret, *Slavery,* 259, believes that 'the number of slaves was substantially reduced in the century and a half preceding the Conquest'; he offers a Domesday figure of around 10% of the population (192–93). Bois, *Transformation,* 20–22, who emphasizes the significance of slaves to the region around Lournand, nevertheless calculates that they only constituted about 15% of the inhabitants.

[42] Bois, *Transformation,* 22.

[43] 'Horizontal recruitment' by the king from a social class is discussed in Halsall, *Warfare and Society,* 40–70. For skepticism about the persistence of mass mobilization, see R. P. Abels, *Lordship and Military Obligation in Anglo-Saxon England* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), esp. 175–79; and Delogu, 'Lombard and Carolingian Italy', in *NCMH,* 2 (1995): 290–319, esp. 290–91 and 202–03.

[44] J. France, 'The Composition and Raising of the Armies of Charlemagne', *Journal of Medieval Military History,* 1 (2002): 61–82; and Halsall, *Warfare and Society,* 73–110. The parallel organization of Ottonian armies is described in D. S. Bachrach, 'The Military Organization of Ottonian Germany, c. 900–1018: The Views of Bishop Thietmar of Merseburg', *The Journal of Military History,* 72 (2008): 1061–1088.

[45] L. White Jr., *Medieval Technology and Social Change* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1962), 1–38; leading to the debate summarized in A. Roland, 'Once More into the Stirrups: Lynn White Jr., *Medieval Technology and Social Change*', *Technology and Culture,* 44 (2003): 574–85. For problems with an alleged 'Saxon Military Revolution',

see B. S. Bachrach and D. S Bachrach, 'Saxon Military Revolution, 912–973? Myth and Reality', *Early Medieval Europe*, 15 (2007): 186–222.

[46] D. S. Bachrach, 'Memory, Epistemology, and the Writing of Early Medieval History: The Example of Bishop Theitmar of Merseburg (1009–1018)', *Viator*, 38 (2007): 63–90. For a defense of cavalry's dominant role, see J. F. Verbruggen, 'The Role of the Cavalry in Medieval Warfare', trans. K. DeVries, *Journal of Medieval Military History*, 3 (2005): 46–71.

[47] On the strengths and weaknesses of popular militias, see Bachrach and Bachrach, 'Saxon Military Revolution'.

[48] Poly and Bournazel, *Feudal Transformation*, 353.

[49] J. Bernhardt, *Itinerant Kingship and Royal Monasteries in Early Medieval Germany, 936–1075*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th ser., vol. 21 (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1993). Yet dependence on ecclesiastical hospitality exhibited much variation: see C. Brühl, *Fodrum, gistum, servitium regis: Studien zu den wirtschaftlichen Grundlagen des Königtums im Frankenreich und in den frankischen Nachfolgestaaten Deutschland, Frankreich und Italien vom 6. bis zur Mitte des 14. Jahrhunderts*, 2 vols., Kölner historische Abhandlungen, vol. 14(1–2) (Cologne: Böhlau, 1968).

[50] Bowlus, 'The Early *Kaiserreich* in Recent German Historiography', *Central European History*, 23 (1990): 349–76, esp. 360–63, sums up some of the traditional debates on the German 'Imperial Church System'. Warner, 'The Image of the Ottonian Bishop', in M. Frassetto (ed.), *The Year 1000: Religious and Social Response to the Turning of the First Millennium* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2002), 85–110, illuminates royal and aristocratic involvement with the episcopate.

[51] C. S. Jaeger, 'The Courtier Bishop in *Vitae* from the Tenth through the Twelfth Century', *Speculum*, 58 (1983): 291–325; Jaeger, *The Origins of Courtliness: Civilizing Trends and the Formation of Courtly Ideals, 939–1210* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1985), 4–5 and 21–48; A. Scaglione, *Knights at Court: Courtliness, Chivalry, and Courtesy from Ottonian Germany to the Italian Renaissance* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991); Jaeger, *The Envy of Angels: Cathedral Schools and Social Ideals in Medieval Europe, 950–1200* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994), 36–47 and 53–54. The limits of clerical success in molding chivalry are analyzed in R. W. Kaeuper, *Chivalry and Violence in Medieval Europe* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999).

[52] Jaeger, 'Philosophy, ca. 950–1050', *Viator*, 40 (2009): 17–40.

[53] In the tenth century, many lay leaders, including the Ottonian emperors, followed the predominant Roman and clerical example and became clean-shaven: see G. Constable, 'Introduction on Beards in the Middle Ages', in R. B. C. Huygens (ed.), *Apologiae Duae*, Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis, vol. 62 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1985), 47–130, esp. 62–63 and 92–95.

[54] G. Althoff, *Spielregeln der Politik im Mittelalter: Kommunikation in Frieden und Fehde* (Darmstadt: Primus, 1997), and *Die Macht der Rituale: Symbolik und Herrschaft im Mittelalter* (Darmstadt: Primus, 2003). Much of the extensive bibliography on highly developed German court culture is cited in D. A. Warner, 'Ritual and Memory in the Ottonian *Reich*: The Ceremony of *Adventus*', *Speculum*, 76 (2001): 255–83.

[55] B. S. Bachrach, 'Neo-Roman vs. Feudal: The Heuristic Value of a Construct for the Reign of Fulk Nerra, Count of the Angevins (987–1040)', *Cithara*, 30 (1990): 3–30, esp. 12.

[56] M. Keen, *Chivalry* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984), 21–43; C. B. Bouchard, *'Strong of Body, Brave and Noble': Chivalry and Society in Medieval France* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1998), 107–12; J. Flori, 'Knightly Society', in *NCMH*, vol. 4/1 (2004): 148–84, esp. 148–50; D. Crouch, *The Birth of Nobility: Constructing Aristocracy in England and France, 900–1300* (Harlow, UK: Pearson Longman, 2006), 28–42 and 71–74.

[57] Tilliette, 'Le Xe siècle dans l'histoire de la literature', in Iogna-Prat and Picard (eds.), *Religion et culture autour de l'an Mil*, 93–98; Jaeger, 'Pessimism in the Twelfth-Century "Renaissance"', *Speculum* 78(4) (2003): 1151–83, esp. 1181.

[58] For the revival of interest in Vitruvius' work on architecture, see C. H. Krinsky, 'Seventy-Eight Vitruvius Manuscripts', *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 30 (1967): 36–70; C. Heitz, 'Vitruve et l'architecture du haut moyen âge', in *La cultura antica nell'Occidente latino dal VII all'XI secolo: 18–24 aprile 1974*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, 22, vol. 2 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1975) 725–57. Vitruvius was just one element of the tenth-century revival of Classical and early Christian sources described in Hiscock, *The Wise Master Builder: Platonic Geometry in Plans of Medieval Abbeys and Cathedrals* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 2000), 25–95.

[59] R. Krautheimer, 'Introduction to an Iconography of Medieval Architecture', *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 5 (1942): 1–33. England built on a traditional dependence on Roman prototypes described in N. Howe, 'Rome: Capital of Anglo-Saxon England', *The Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 34 (2004): 147–72; and J. Hawkes, '*Iuxta Morem Romanorum*: Stone and Sculpture in Anglo-Saxon England', in C. E. Karkov and G. H. Brown (eds.), *Anglo-Saxon Styles*, SUNY Series in Medieval Studies (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2003), 69–99, esp. 71.

[60] For an evocative image of the tenth-century papacy, see R. W. Southern, *The Making of the Middle Ages* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953), 134–38. The surviving papal correspondence of the tenth century is published in Zimmermann (ed.), *Papsturkunden, 896–1046*, 3 vols., Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Denkschriften, Philosophisch-Historische Klasse, vols. 174, 177, and 198 (Vienna: Österreichischen Akademie der

Wissenschaften, 1984–89). H.-H. Kortüm, *Zur päpstlichen Urkundensprache im Frühen Mittelalter: Die päpstlichen Privilegien, 896–1046*, Beiträge zur Geschichte und Quellenkunde des Mittelalters, vol. 17 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke, 1995), esp. 424–25, argues on the basis of stylistic anomalies that a reactive papacy is revealed by these letters, which appear to have been drafted by their recipients.

[61] J. Fried, *Otto III. und Bolesław Chrobry: Das Widmungsbild des Aachener Evangeliars, der "Akt von Gnesen" und das frühe Polnische und Ungarische Königtum. Eine Bildanalyse und ihre historischen Folgen*, Frankfurter historische Abhandlungen, vol. 30 (Stuttgart: F. Steiner Verlag Wiesbaden, 1989); K. Görich, *Otto III Romanus Saxonicus et Italicus: Kaiserliche Rompolitik und sächsische Historiographie*, Historische Forschungen, vol. 18 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke Verlag, 1993); E. Eickhoff, *Theophanu und der König: Otto III. und seine Welt* (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 1996); B. Schneidmüller and S. Weinfurter (eds.), *Otto III., Heinrich II.: Eine Wende? Mittelalter-Forschungen*, vol. 1 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke Verlag, 1997); S. Waldhoff, 'Der Kaiser in der Krise? Zum Verständnis von Thietmar IV, 48', *Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters*, 54 (1998): 23–54; Eickhoff, *Kaiser Otto III: Die erste Jahrtausendwende und die Entfaltung Europas* (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 1999); S. Hamilton, '"Most Illustrious King of Kings": Evidence for Ottonian Kingship in the Otto III Prayerbook (Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 30111)', *Journal of Medieval History*, 27 (2001): 57–88; M. Gabriele, 'Otto III, Charlemagne, and Pentecost A.D. 1000: A Reconsideration Using Diplomatic Evidence', in Frassetto (ed.), *The Year 1000*, 111–32; Fried, *Das Widmungsbild des Aachener Evangeliars, der "Akt von Gnesen" und das frühe polnische und ungarische Königtum. Eine Bildanalyse und ihre historischen Folgen*, Frankfurter Historische Abhandlungen, vol. 30 (1989), 2nd rev. edn. (Stuttgart: F. Steiner, 2001); G. Althoff, *Otto III*, trans. Phyllis G. Jestice (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2003).

[62] Gerbert, *Letter 232* (to Otto III, Dec. 26, 997), trans. H. P. Lattin, *The Letters of Gerbert with His Papal Privileges as Sylvester II* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1961), 287–99.

[63] Thietmar, *Chronicon IV xlvii*, in Warner (trans.), *Ottonian Germany*, 185.

[64] The definitive interpreter of the textual and iconographic evidence for Otto's program of Roman renewal was P. E. Schramm, most famously in *Kaiser, Rom und Renovatio: Studien und Texte zur Geschichte des römischen Erneuerungsgedankens vom Ende des karolingischen Reiches bis zum Investiturstreit*, 2 vols., Studien der Bibliothek Warburg, vol. 17. (1929), 4th edn. (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1984). Recent scholars have questioned Schramm's tendency to interpret all evidence in terms of an overarching program, his claim that Otto had a secular vision of Rome, and his focus on ideals rather than on practical policies: see Görich, *Otto III*, 187–209; Althoff, *Otto III*, 81–89; and Warner, 'Ideals and Actions in the Reign of Otto III', *Journal of Medieval History*, 25 (1999): 1–18.

[65] T. Reuter, 'The Making of England and Germany, 850–1050: Points of Comparison and Difference', in *Medieval Europeans: Studies in Ethnic Identity and National Perspectives in Medieval Europe*, ed. A. P. Smyth (London: Macmillan Press, 1998), 53–70, esp. 54–55, repr. in his *Medieval Politics*, 284–99, esp. 284–85, sees the tenth-century German kingdom as an artificial construct; Nelson, 'Frankish Idenity in Charlemagne's Empire', in I. H. Garipzanov, P. J. Geary and P. Urbańczyk (eds.), *Franks, Northmen, and Slavs: Identities and State Formation in Early Medieval Europe*, Cursor mundi, vol. 5 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008), 71–83, takes a similar view of the Carolingian Empire. A symposium on the cohesion of the Ottonian world – featuring contributions by H. Keller, G. Althoff, R. Schieffer, and J. Ehlers – appears in *Frühmittelalterliche Studien*, 23 (1989): 244–31. For the contrast with the Byzantine situation, see A. Kazhdan and G. Constable, *People and Power in Byzantium: An introduction to Modern Byzantine Studies* (Washington, DC: Dumbarton Oaks, Center for Byzantine Studies, Trustees for Harvard University, 1982), 29–32, 95, 123–26.

[66] For a more nuanced analysis of Roman appeal and ideal, see J. M. H. Smith, *Europe after Rome: A New Cultural History, 500–1000* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), 253–92.

[67] The historiographical development of the 'terrors of the year 1000' is surveyed in S. Gouguenheim, *Les fausses terreurs de l'an mil: Attente de la fin des temps ou approfondissement de la foi?* (Paris: Picard, 1999), 23–43; E. Peters, 'Mutations, Adjustments, Terrors, Historians, and the Year 1000', in Frasetto (ed.), *The Year 1000*, 9–28; B. McGinn, 'The End Is Not Yet: Reflections on the State of Apocalyptic Studies', and A., Vauchez, 'Omniprésence de l'apocalyptisme dans l'histoire', in Vauchez (ed.), *L'Attente des temps nouveaux: Eschatologie, millénarismes et visions du futur, du moyen age au XX siècle* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2002), 135–41 and 143–48. To do justice to the lively debates that reemerged as the millennial year 2000 approached would require a separate *History Compass* survey.

Bibliography

Abels, R. P., *Lordship and Military Obligation in Anglo-Saxon England* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988).

Adalbert of Magdeburg, *Chronicon*, in S. MacLean (trans.), *History and Politics in Late Carolingian and Ottonian Europe: The Chronicle of Regino of Prüm and Adalbert of Magdeburg* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2009).

Althoff, G., *Die Macht der Rituale: Symbolik und Herrschaft im Mittelalter* (Darmstadt: Primus, 2003).

Althoff, G., *Otto III*, trans. P. G. Jestice. (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2003).

Althoff, G., *Spielregeln der Politik im Mittelalter: Kommunikation in Frieden und Fehde* (Darmstadt: Primus, 1997).

Arnaldi, G., 'Mito e realtà del secolo X romano e papale', in *Il Secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19-25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), vol. 1, 25–53.

Bachrach, B. S., 'Are They Not Like Us? The Carolingian Fisc in Military Perspective', in C. Chazelle and F. Lifshitz (eds.) *Paradigms and Methods in Early Medieval Studies* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2007), 119–133.

Bachrach, B. S., 'Neo-Roman vs. Feudal: The Heuristic Value of a Construct for the Reign of Fulk Nerra, Count of the Angevins (987–1040)', *Cithara*, 30 (1990): 3–30.

Bachrach, B. S., and Bachrach, D. S., 'Saxon Military Revolution, 912–973? Myth and Reality', *Early Medieval Europe*, 15 (2007): 186–222.

Bachrach, D. S., 'Memory, Epistemology, and the Writing of Early Medieval History: The Example of Bishop Theitmar of Merseburg (1009–1018)', *Viator*, 38 (2007): 63–90.

Bachrach, D. S., 'The Military Organization of Ottonian Germany, c. 900–1018: The Views of Bishop Thietmar of Merseburg', *The Journal of Military History*, 72 (2008): 1061–1088.

Barceló, M., and Toubert, P. (eds.), *L'Incastellamento: Actes des rencontres de Gérone (26-27 novembre 1992) et de Rome (5-7 mai 1994)*, Collection de l'École française de Rome, vol. 241 (Rome: ÉFR, 1998).

Barendse, R. J., 'The Feudal Mutation: Military and Economic Transformations of the Ethnosphere in the Tenth to Thirteenth Centuries', *Journal of World History*, 14 (2003): 503–29.

Baronius, C., *Annales Ecclesiastici*, in A. Theiner (ed.), *Annales Ecclesiastici*, 37 vols. (Bar-le-Duc: L. Guerin, 1864–83), vol. 15, 467.

Barthélemy, D., *Chevaliers et miracles: La violence et le sacré dans la société féodale* (Paris: Colin, 2004).

Barthélemy, D., 'Debate: The "Feudal Revolution" (I)', *Past & Present*, 152 (1996): 196–205.

Barthélemy, D., 'La mutation féodale a-t-elle eu lieu? (Note critique)', *Annales: Économies, sociétés, civilisation*, 47 (1992): 767–777, lightly revised and repr. in Barthélemy, *La Mutation de l'an mil a-t-elle eu lieu? Servage et chevalerie dans la France des X⁰ et XI⁰ siècles* (Paris: Fayard, 1997), 13–28.

Barthélemy, D., *The Serf, the Knight, and the Historian*, trans. G. R. Edwards (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2009).

Barton, R. E., *Lordship in the County of Maine, c. 890–1160* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 2004).

Bernhardt, J., *Itinerant Kingship and Royal Monasteries in Early Medieval Germany, 936–1075*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th ser., vol. 21 (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1993).

Berschin, W., *Biographie und Epochenstil im lateinischen Mittelalter*, 4 vols. in 5 (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann Verlag, 1986–2001).

Bisson, T. N., *The Crisis of the Twelfth Century: Power, Lordship, and the Origins of European Government* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009).

Bisson, T. N., 'The "Feudal Revolution"', *Past & Present*, 142 (1994): 6–42.

Bloch, M., 'How and Why Ancient Slavery Came to an End', in *Slavery and Serfdom in the Middle Ages: Selected Essays by Marc Bloch*, trans. W. Beer (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975), 1–31.

Bois, G., *The Transformation of the Year One Thousand: The Village of Lournand from Antiquity to Feudalism*, trans. J. Birrell (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1992).

Bonnassie, P., *From Slavery to Feudalism in South-Western Europe*, trans. J. Birrell, Past and Present Publications (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1991).

Bonnassie, P., 'The Survival and Extinction of the Slave System in the Early Medieval West (Fourth to Eleventh Centuries)', in Bonassie (ed.), *From Slavery to Feudalism in South-Western Europe*, trans. J. Birrell, Past and Present Publications (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1991), 1–59.

Bonnassie, P., and Toubert, P. (eds.), *Hommes et sociétés dans l'Europe de l'an mil* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 2004).

Bouchard, C. B., *'Strong of Body, Brave and Noble': Chivalry and Society in Medieval France* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1998).

Bourin, M., and Rosenwein, B. H. (eds.), *L'An Mil en 2000*, *Médiévales* [dedicated issue], 37 (1999): 1–114.

Bowersock, G. W., Brown, P., and Grabar, O. (eds.), *Late Antiquity: A Guide to the Postclassical World* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1999).

Bowlus, C. R. 'The Early Kaiserreich in Recent German Historiography', *Central European History*, 23 (1990): 349–76.

Bowlus, C. R., 'Mitteleuropa: The Making of Europe between Byzantium and the Latin West, ca. 800–1025', in C. Chazelle and F. Lifshitz (eds.), *Paradigms and Methods in Early Medieval Studies* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2007), 185–202.

Bowman, J., *Shifting Landmarks: Property, Proof, and Dispute in Catalonia around the Year 1000* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2004).

Brown, P., *The Rise of Western Christendom: Triumph and Diversity, A.D. 200–1000*, 2nd edn. (Oxford: Blackwell, 2003).

Brown, P., *The World of Late Antiquity, AD 150–750* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971).

Brown, P. R., McMillin, L. A., and Wilson, K. M. (eds.), *Hrotsvit of Gandersheim* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004).

Brown, W. C., and Górecki, P. (eds.), *Conflict in Medieval Europe: Changing Perspectives on Society and Culture* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2003).

Brown, W. C., and Górecki, P., 'What Conflict Means: The Making of Medieval Conflict Studies in the United States, 1970–2000,' in W. C. Brown and P. Górecki (eds.), *Conflict in Medieval Europe: Changing Perspectives on Society and Culture* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2003), 1–35.

Brühl, C., *Fodrum, gistum, servitium regis: Studien zu den wirtschaftlichen Grundlagen des Königtums im Frankenreich und in den fränkischen Nachfolgestaaten Deutschland, Frankreich und Italien vom 6. bis zur Mitte des 14. Jahrhunderts*, 2 vols., Kölner historische Abhandlungen, vol. 14(1–2) (Cologne: Böhlau Verlag, 1968).

Buc, P., 'Italian Hussies and German Matrons: Liudprand of Cremona on Dynastic Legitimacy', *Frühmittelalterliche Studien*, 29 (1995): 207–25.

Buc, P., 'Writing Ottonian Hegemony: Good Rituals and Bad Rituals in Liudprand of Cremona', *Majestas*, 4 (1996): 3–38.

Bull, M., *Thinking Medieval: An Introduction to the Study of the Middle Ages* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005).

Carmen Pallares Méndez, M. del, *Ilduara, una arostócrata del siglo X*, 2nd edn. (A Coruña: Edicios do Castro, 2004).

Carozzi, C., and Taviani-Carozzi, H. (eds.), *Année mille, an mil* (Aix-en-Provence: Publications de l'Université de Provence, 2002).

Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, *La cultura antica nell'Occidente latino dal VII all'XI secolo: 18-24 aprile 1974*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 22 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1975).

Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, *Il Secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19-25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991).

Chazelle, C., and Lifshitz, F. (eds.), *Paradigms and Methods in Early Medieval Studies* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2007).

Christiansen, E. (trans.), *Dudo of St. Quentin: History of the Normans* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 1998).

Clark, K., *Civilization: A Personal View* (London: BBC, 1969).

Constable, G., 'Introduction on Beards in the Middle Ages', in R. B. C. Huygens (ed.), *Apologiae Duae*, Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis, vol. 62 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1985), 47–130.

Corbet, P., *Les saints ottoniens: Sainteté dynastique, sainteté royale et sainteté féminineàamour de l'An Mil*, Beihefte zu Francia, vol. 15 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke Verlag, 1986).

Corbet, P., Goullet, M., and Iogna-Prat, D., (eds.), *Adélaïde de Bourgogne: Genèse et représentations d'une sainteté impériale. Actes du colloque international du Centre d'études médiévales-UMR 5594, Auxerre, 10 et 11 décembre 1999* (Paris: Comité des travaux historiques et scientifiques, 2002).

Crouch, D., *The Birth of Nobility: Constructing Aristocracy in England and France, 900-1300* (Harlow, UK: Pearson Longman, 2006).

Curta, F. (ed.), *East Central & Eastern Europe in the Early Middle Ages* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005).

Davids, A. (ed.), *The Empress Theophano: Byzantium and the West at the Turn of the First Millennium* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1995).

Dawson, C., *The Making of Europe: An Introduction to the History of European Unity* (London: Sheed & Ward, 1948).

Dawson, C., *Religion and the Rise of Western Culture* (London: Sheed and Ward, 1950).

Delogu, P., 'Lombard and Carolingian Italy', in *NCMH*, vol. 2 (1995): 290–319.

Delogu, P., 'Reading Pirenne Again', in R. Hodges and W. Bowden (eds.), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 3 (Leiden: Brill, 1998), 15–40.

Dodwell, C. R., *Painting in Europe, 800 to 1200* (Baltimore: Penguin Books, 1972).

Dodwell, C. R., *The Pictorial Arts of the West, 800–1200* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1993).

Duby, G., *La société aux XIe et XIIe siècles dans la région mâconnaise* (Paris: A. Colin, 1953).

Duby, G., *The Three Orders: Feudal Society Imagined*, trans. A. Goldhammer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980).

Duby, G., and Mandrou, R., *Histoire de la civilisation française*, 2 vols. (Paris: A. Colin, 1958).

Duckett, E., *Death and Life in the Tenth Century* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, 1967).

Dudo of St. Quentin, *Historia Normannorum*, in E. Christiansen (trans.), *Dudo of St. Quentin: History of the Normans* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 1998).

Durliat, J., *Les finances publiques de Dioclétien aux Carolingiens (284-889)* (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke, 1990).

Eickhoff, E., *Kaiser Otto III: Die erste Jahrtausendwende und die Entfaltung Europas* (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 1999).

Eickhoff, E., *Theophanu und der König: Otto III. und seine Welt* (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 1996).

Epstein, S. A., *Speaking of Slavery: Color, Ethnicity, and Human Bondage in Italy* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2001).

Fanning, S., and Bachrach, B. S. (trans.), *The Annals of Flodoard of Reims, 919-966*, Readings in Medieval Civilizations and Cultures, vol. 9 (Peterborough, ON: Broadview Press, 2004).

Fichtenau, H., *Lebensordnungen des 10. Jahrhunderts: Studien über Denkart und Existenz im einstigen Karolingerreich*, 2 vols., Monographien zur Geschichte des Mittelalters, vols. 30(1–2) (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann Verlag, 1984). In one vol., without the original notes, in P. J. Geary (ed. and trans.), *Living in the Tenth Century: Mentalities and Social Orders* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991).

Flodoard of Rheims, *Annales*, in S. Fanning and B. S. Bachrach (trans.), *The Annals of Flodoard, 919-966*, Readings in Medieval Civilizations and Cultures, vol. 9 (Peterborough, ON: Broadview Press, 2004).

Flori, J. 'Knightly Society', in *NCMH*, 4/1 (2004): 148–84.

Fossier, R., *Enfance de l'Europe: X^e-XIIe siècle. Aspects économiques et sociaux*, 2 vols. (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1982).

Fossier, R., 'Rural Economy and Country Life', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999): 27–63.

France, J., 'The Composition and Raising of the Armies of Charlemagne', *Journal of Medieval Military History*, 1 (2002): 61–82.

France, J. (ed. and trans.), *Rodulfi Glabri, Historiarum Libri Quinque/Rodulfus Glaber: The Five Books of the Histories*, Oxford Medieval Texts (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989).

Frassetto, M. (ed.), *The Year 1000: Religions and Social Response to the Turning of the First Millennium* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2002).

Fried, J., *Otto III. und Boleslaw Chrobry: Das Widmungsbild des Aachener Evangeliars, der "Akt von Gnesen" und das frühe Polnische und Ungarische Königtum: Eine Bildanalyse und ihre historischen Folgen*, Frankfurter historische Abhandlungen, vol. 30 (Stuttgart: F. Steiner Verlag Wiesbaden, 1989).

Fried, J., *Das Widmungsbild des Aachener Evangeliars, der "Akt von Gnesen" und das frühe polnische und ungarische Königtum. Eine Bildanalyse und ihre historischen Folgen*, Frankfurter Historische Abhandlungen, vol. 30 (1989), 2nd revised edn. (Stuttgart: F. Steiner Verlag, 2001).

Gabriele, M., 'Otto III, Charlemagne, and Pentecost A.D. 1000: A Reconsideration Using Diplomatic Evidence', in M. Frassetto (ed.), *The Year 1000: Religions and Social Response to the Turning of the First Millennium* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2002), 111–32.

Garipzanov, I. H., Geary, P. J., and Urbańczyk, P. (eds.), *Franks, Northmen, and Slavs: Identities and State Formation in Early Medieval Europe*, Cursor mundi, vol. 5 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008).

Geary, P. J., 'Monastic Memory and the Mutation of the Year Thousand', in S. Farmer and B. H. Rosenwein (eds.), *Monks and Nuns, Saints and Outcasts: Religion in Medieval Society. Essays in Honor of Lester K. Little* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2000), 19–36.

Gerbert of Rheims, Letters, in Lattin (trans.), *Letters of Gerbert with His Papal Privileges as Sylvester II* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1961).

Gibbon, E., *The Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, ed. J. B. Bury, 3 vols. (New York: Heritage Press, 1946).

Gilsdorf, S. (trans.), *Queenship and Sanctity: The 'Lives' of Mathilda and the 'Epitaph' of Adelheid* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2004).

Görich, K., *Otto III Romanus Saxonicus et Italicus: Kaiserliche Rompolitik und sächsische Historiographie*, Historische Forschungen, vol. 18 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke, 1993).

Goffart, W., *Barbarian Tides: The Migration Age and the Later Roman Empire* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006).

Goffart, W., *Barbarians and Romans, A.D. 418–584: The Techniques of Accommodation* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980).

Goffart, W., 'Rome's Final Conquest: The Barbarians', *History Compass*, 6/3 (2008): 855–883.

Gouguenheim, S., *Les fausses terreurs de l'an mil: Attente de la fin des temps ou approfondissement de la foi?* (Paris: Picard, 1999).

Halsall, G., *Barbarian Migrations and the Roman West, 376–568*, Cambridge Medieval Textbooks (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2007).

Halsall, G., *Warfare and Society in the Barbarian West, 450–900* (London: Routledge, 2003).

Hamilton, S., '"Most Illustrious King of Kings": Evidence for Ottonian Kingship in the Otto III Prayerbook (Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 30111)', *Journal of Medieval History*, 27 (2001): 57–88.

Hammer, C. L., *A Large-Scale Slave Society of the Early Middle Ages: Slaves and Their Families in Early Medieval Bavaria* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2002).

Hawkes, J., 'Iuxta Morem Romanorum: Stone and Sculpture in Anglo-Saxon England', in C. E. Karkov and G. H. Brown (eds.), *Anglo-Saxon Styles*, SUNY Series in Medieval Studies (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2003), 69–99.

Heather, P., *The Fall of the Roman Empire: A New History of Rome and the Barbarians* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).

Heitz, C., 'Vitruve et l'architecture du haut moyen âge', in CISAM (ed.), *La cultura antica, nell'Occidente latino dal VII all'XI scolo: 18-24 aprile 1974*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 22 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1975), 725–57.

Heitzman, J., and Schenkluhn, W. (eds.), *The World in the Year 1000* (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 2004).

Henning, J. (ed.), *Europa im 10. Jahrhundert: Archäologie einer Aufbruchszeit, Internationale Tagung in Vorbereitung der Ausstellung "Otto der Große, Magdeburg und Europa"* (Mainz am Rhein: Verlag Philipp von Zabern, 2002).

Hernaes, P., and Iversen, T. (eds.), *Slavery across Time and Space: Studies in Slavery in Medieval Europe and Africa*, Trondheim Studies in History, vol. 38 (Trondheim: NTRNU Department of History, 2002).

Hiscock, N. (ed.), *The White Mantle of Churches: Architecture, Liturgy, and Art around the Millennium*, International Medieval Research Art History, vol. 10 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003).

Hiscock, N., *The Wise Master Builder: Platonic Geometry in Plans of Medieval Abbeys and Cathedrals* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 2000).

Hodges, R., 'Henri Pirenne and the Question of Demand in the Sixth Century', in R. Hodges and W. Bowden (eds.), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 3 (Leiden: Brill, 1998): 3–14.

Hodges, R., and Bowden, W. (eds.), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 3 (Leiden: Brill, 1998).

Howe, J., *Church Reform and Social Change in Eleventh-Century Italy: Dominic of Sora and His Patrons* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997).

Howe, N., 'Rome: Capital of Anglo-Saxon England', *The Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 34 (2004): 147–72.

Innes, M., *An Introduction to Early Medieval Western Europe, 300–900: The Sword, the Plough, and the Book* (London: Routledge, 2007).

Iogna-Prat, D., and Picard, J. C. (eds.), *Religion et culture autour de l'an Mil. Royaume capétien et Lotharingie: Actes du Colloque Hugues Capet 987–1987, la France de l'an Mil, Auxerre, 26 et 27 juin 1987 – Metz, 11 et 12 septembre 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1990).

Jaeger, C. S., 'The Courtier Bishop in Vitae from the Tenth through the Twelfth Century', *Speculum*, 58 (1983): 291–325.

Jaeger, C. S., *The Envy of Angels: Cathedral Schools and Social Ideals in Medieval Europe, 950–1200* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994).

Jaeger, C. S., *The Origins of Courtliness: Civilizing Trends and the Formation of Courtly Ideals, 939–1210* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1985).

Jaeger, C. S., 'Pessimism in the Twelfth-Century "Renaissance"', *Speculum*, 78/4 (2003): 1151–83.

Jaeger, C. S., 'Philosophy, ca. 950–1050', *Viator*, 40 (2009): 17–40.

Jasper, D., 'Prefatory Remarks' and 'Conclusion', in D. Jasper and H. Fuhrmann (eds.), *Papal Letters in the Early Middle Ages*, History of Medieval Canon Law (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2001), 3–6 and 131–34.

Kaeuper, R. W., *Chivalry and Violence in Medieval Europe* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999).

Karkov, C. E., and Brown, G. H. (eds.), *Anglo-Saxon Styles*, SUNY Series in Medieval Studies (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2003).

Karras, R. M., *Slavery and Society in Medieval Scandinavia* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988).

Kazhdan, A., and Constable, G., *People and Power in Byzantium: An introduction to Modern Byzantine Studies* (Washington, DC: Dumbarton Oaks, Center for Byzantine Studies, Trustees for Harvard University, 1982).

Keen, M., *Chivalry* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984).

Knowles, D., *The Monastic Order in England* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1940).

Kortüm, H.-H., *Zur päpstlichen Urkundensprache im Frühen Mittelalter: Die päpstlichen Privilegien, 896–1046*, Beiträge zur Geschichte und Quellenkunde des Mittelalters, vol. 17 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke, 1995).

Krautheimer, R., 'Introduction to an Iconography of Medieval Architecture', *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 5 (1942): 1–33.

Krinsky, C. H., 'Seventy-Eight Vitruvius Manuscripts', *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 30 (1967): 36–70.

Lattin, H. P. (trans.), *The Letters of Gerbert with His Papal Privileges as Sylvester II* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1961).

Lauranson-Rosaz, C., 'Le débat sur la "mutation féodale": État de la question', in P. Urbańczyk (ed.), *Europe around the Year 1000* (Warsaw: Polish Academy of Sciences Institute of Archaeology and Ethnology, 2001), 11–40.

Le Jan, R., 'Le Royaume franc vers 900: Un pouvoir en mutation?', in P. Baudouin (ed.), *Les fondations scandinaves en Occident et les débuts du duché de Normandie: Colloque de Cerisy-la-Salle (25–29 septembre 2002)* (Caen: Publications du CRAHM, 2005), 83–95.

Leyser, K., 'Ritual, Ceremony, and Gesture: Ottonian Germany', in T. Reuter (ed.), *Communications and Power in Medieval Europe*, 2 vols (London: Hambledon Press, 1994), vol. 1, 189–213.

Leyser, K., *Rule and Conflict in an Early Medieval Society: Ottonian Saxony* (London: Arnold, 1979).

Liebeschuetz, J. H. W. G., *Decline and Fall of the Roman City* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001).

Liebeschütz, W., 'Cities, Taxes, and the Accommodation of the Barbarians: The Theories of Durliat and Goffart', in W. Pohl (ed.), *Kingdoms of the Empire: The Integration of Barbarians in Late Antiquity*, The Transformation of the Roman world, vol. 1 (Leiden: Brill, 1997), 135–51.

Linehan, P., and Nelson, J. (eds.), *The Medieval World* (New York: Routledge, 2001).

Liudprand of Cremona, *Historia Ottonis*, in P. Squatriti (trans.), *The Complete Works of Liudprand of Cremona*, Medieval Texts in Translation (Washington, DC: The Catholic University of America Press, 2007).

Lopez, R. S., 'Still Another Renaissance?', *American Historical Review*, 57 (1951): 1–21.

Lopez, R. S., *The Tenth Century: How Dark the Dark Ages? Source Problems in World Civilization* (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1959).

Luzzatto, G., *I servi nelle grandi proprietà ecclesiastiche italiane dei secoli IX e X* (Senigallia: Società tipografica Marchigiana, 1909), repr. in *Dai servi della gleba agli albori del capitalismo. Saggi del storia economica* (Bari: Laterza, 1909), 1–177.

Magdalino, P. (ed.), *Byzantium in the Year 1000*, The Medieval Mediterranean, vol. 45 (Leiden: Brill, 2003).

Magdalino, P., 'The Year 1000 in Byzantium', in P. Magdalino (ed.), *Byzantium in the Year 1000*, The Medieval Mediterranean, vol. 45 (Leiden: Brill, 2003), 233–70.

MacLean, S. (trans.), *History and Politics in Late Carolingian and Ottonian Europe: The Chronicle of Regino of Prüm and Adalbert of Magdeburg* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2009).

McCormick, M. *Origins of the European Economy: Communications and Commerce, A.D. 300–900* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001).

McGinn, B., 'The End Is Not Yet: Reflections on the State of Apocalyptic Studies', in André Vauchez (ed.), *L'Attente des temps nouveaux* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2002), 135–41.

Munz, P., 'Early European History and African Anthropology', *The New Zealand Journal of History*, 10 (1976): 37–50.

Munz, P., 'Medieval History in Australasia, or the End of the Ancient World', *Historical Studies, Australia and New Zealand*, 11 (1963): 1–17.

Musset, L., *Nordica et Normannica: Recueil d'études sur la Scandinavie ancienne et médiévale, les expéditions des Vikings et la fondation de la Normandie*, Studia nordica, vol. 1 (Paris: Société des études nordiques, 1997).

Musset, L. 'La renaissance urbaine des Xe et XIe siècles dans l'ouest de la France: Problèmes et hypothèses de travail', in *Études de civilisation médiévale, IXe–XIIe siècles: Mélanges offerts à Edmond-René Labande à l'occasion de son départ à la retraite et du XXe anniversaire du C. É.S.C.M.* (Poitiers: C.E.S.C.M, 1974), 563–75, repr. in his *Nordica et Normannica : Recueil d'études sur la Scandinavie ancienne et médiévale, les expéditions des Vikings et la fondation de la Normandie*, Studia nordica, vol.1 (Paris: Société des études nordiques, 1997).

NCMH, designates *The New Cambridge Medieval History [NCMH]*, 8 vols. (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1995–2005).

Nelson, J., 'Frankish Identity in Charlemagne's Empire', in I. H. Garipzanov, et al. (eds.), *Franks, Northmen, and Slavs: Identities and State Formation in Early Medieval Europe*, Cursor mundi, vol. 5 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008), 71–83.

Nelson, J., 'Kingship and Royal Government', in *NCMH*, vol. 2 (1995): 383–430.

Parsons, D. (ed.), *Tenth-Century Studies: Essays in Commemoration of the Millennium of the Council of Winchester and Regularis Concordia* (London: Phillimore, 1975).

Pelteret, D. A. E., *Slavery in Early Mediaeval England: From the Reign of Alfred until the Twelfth Century* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 1995).

Peters, E., 'Mutations, Adjustments, Terrors, Historians, and the Year 1000', in M. Frasetto (ed.), *The Year 1000: Religious and Social Response to the Turning of the First Millennium* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2002), 9–28.

Piazzoni, A. M., 'Biografie dei papi del secolo X nelle continuazioni del *Liber pontificalis*', *Mittellateinisches Jahrbuch*, 24/25 (1991): 369–82.

Pirenne, H., *Medieval Cities: Their Origins and the Revival of Trade*, trans. F. D. Halsey (1925, repr. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1958).

Pirenne, H., *Mohammed and Charlemagne*, trans. B. Miall (1939, repr. London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 2008).

Poly, J.-P., and Bournazel, É., *The Feudal Transformation, 900–1200*, trans. C. Higgit (New York: Holmes & Meier, 1991).

Regino of Prüm, *Chronicon*, in S. MacLean, (trans.), *History and Politics in Late Carolingian and Ottonian Europe: The Chronicle of Regino of Prüm and Adalbert of Magdeburg* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2009).

Reuter, T. 'Debate: The "Feudal Revolution" (III)', *Past & Present*, 155 (1997): 177–95, repr. in Reuter, *Medieval Politics*, 72–88.

Reuter, T., 'Introduction: Reading the Tenth Century', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999): 1–24.

Reuter, T. 'The Making of England and Germany, 850–1050: Points of Comparison and Difference', in A. P. Smyth (ed.), *Medieval Europeans: Studies in Ethnic Identity and National Perspectives in Medieval Europe* (London: Macmillan Press, 1998), 53–70; repr. in Reuter, T., *Medieval Politics, and Modern Mentalities*, ed. J. L. Nelson (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 284–99.

Reuter, T., 'Medieval: Another Tyrannous Construct?', *The Medieval History Journal*, 1 (1998): 25–45, repr. in Reuter, *Medieval Politics and Modern Mentalities*, ed. J. L. Nelson (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 19–37.

Reuter, T., *Medieval Polities and Modern Mentalities*, ed. J. L. Nelson (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006).

Reuter, T. (ed.), *NCMH, Vol. 3: c. 900–c. 1024* (Cambridge UK: Cambridge University Press, 1999).

Riché, P., *Instruction et vie religieuse dans le Haut Moyen Age*, Collected Studies, vol. 139 (London: Variorum Reprints, 1981).

Riché, P., 'La "Renaissance" intellectuelle du Xᵉ siècle en Occident', *Cahiers d'histoire*, 21 (1976): 27–42, repr. in P. Riché, *Instruction et vie religieuse dans le Haut Moyen Age*, Collected Studies, vol. 139 (London: Variorum Reprints, 1981), [same pagination].

Rodulfus, Glaber, *Historiarum Libri Quinque*, ed. and trans. J. France, Oxford Medieval Texts (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989).

Roland, A., 'Once More into the Stirrups: Lynn White Jr., *Medieval Technology and Social Change*', *Technology and Culture*, 44 (2003): 574–85.

Scaglione, A., *Knights at Court: Courtliness, Chivalry, and Courtesy from Ottonian Germany to the Italian Renaissance* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991).

Schneidmüller, B., and Weinfurter, S. (eds.), *Otto III., Heinrich II.: Eine Wende? Mittelalter-Forschungen*, vol. 1 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke, 1997).

Schramm, P. E., *Kaiser, Rom und Renovatio: Studien und Texte zur Geschichte des römischen Erneuerungsgedankens vom Ende des karolingischen Reiches bis zum Investiturstreit*, 2 vols., Studien der Bibliothek Warburg, vol. 17 (1929), 4th edn. (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1984).

Shepherd, J., 'Conversion and Regimes Compared: The Rus' and the Poles, ca. 1000', in F. Curta (ed.), *East Central & Eastern Europe, Europe in the Early Middle Ages* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005), 254–82.

Smith, C. (ed.), *Before and after the End of Time: Architecture and the Year 1000* (New York: Harvard Design School with George Braziller, 2000).

Smith, J. M. H., *Europe after Rome: A New Cultural History, 500–1000* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).

Smyth, A. P. (ed.), *Medieval Europeans: Studies in Ethnic Identity and National Perspectives in Medieval Europe* (London: Macmillan Press, 1998).

Sot, M., 'L'historiographie latine dans l'Europe de l'An Mil', in P. Bonnassie and P. Toubert (eds.), *Hommes et sociétés dans l'Europe de l'an mil* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 2004), 389–405.

Southern, R. W., *The Making of the Middle Ages* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953).

Squatriti, P. (trans.), *The Complete Works of Liudprand of Cremona, Medieval Texts in Translation* (Washington, DC: The Catholic University of America Press, 2007).

Stafford, P., 'Powerful Women in the Early Middle Ages: Queens and Abbesses', in P. Linehan and J. Nelson (eds.), *The Medieval World* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 398–415.

Sullivan, R. E., 'The Carolingian Age: Reflections on Its Place in the History of the Middle Ages', *Speculum*, 64 (1989): 267–306.

Thietmar, *Chronicon*, in D. Warner (trans.), *Ottonian Germany: The Chronicon of Thietmar of Merseburg*, Manchester Medieval Sources Series (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001).

Tilliette, J.-Y., 'La poésie métrique latine: Ateliers et genres', in D. Iogna-Prat and J. C. Picard (eds.), *Religion et culture autour de l'an Mil. Royaume capétien et Lotharingie: Actes du Colloque Hugues Capet 987–1987, la France de l'an Mil, Auxerre, 26 et 27 juin 1987 - Metz, 11 et 12 septembre 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1990), 103–09.

Tilliette, J.-Y., 'Le Xᵉ siècle dans l'histoire de la littérature', in D. Iogna-Prat and J.C Picard (eds.), *Religion et culture autour de l'an Mil. Royaume capétien et Lotharingie: Actes du Colloque Hugues Capet 987-1987, la France de l'an Mil, Auxerre, 26 et 27 juin 1987 - Metz, 11 et 12 septembre 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1990), 93–98.

Toubert, P., *Dalla terra ai castelli: Paesaggio, agricoltura e poteri nell'Italia medioevale* (Turin: G. Einaudi, 1995).

Urbańczyk, P. (ed.), *Europe around the Year 1000* (Warsaw: Polish Academy of Sciences Institute of Archaeology and Ethnology, 2001).

Vauchez, A. (ed.), *L'Attente des temps nouveaux: Eschatologie, millénarismes et visions du futur, du moyen age au XXᵉ siècle* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2002).

Vauchez, A., 'Omniprésence de l'apocalyptisme dans l'histoire', in A. Vauchez (ed.), *L'Attente des temps nouveaux: Eschatologie, millénarismes et visions du futur, du moyen age au XXᵉ siècle* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2002), 143–48.

Verbruggen, J. F., 'The Role of the Cavalry in Medieval Warfare', trans. K. DeVries, *Journal of Medieval Military History*, 3 (2005): 46–71.

Violante, C., 'La signoria rurale nel secolo X: Proposte tipologiche', in CISAM (ed.), *Il Secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19-25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), vol. 1, 329–89.

Waldhoff, S., 'Der Kaiser in der Krise? Zum Verständnis von Thietmar IV, 48', *Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters*, 54 (1998): 23–54.

Ward-Perkins, B., *The Fall of Rome and the End of Civilization* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005).

Warner, D. A., 'Ideals and Actions in the Reign of Otto III', *Journal of Medieval History*, 25 (1999): 1–18.

Warner, D. A.,'The Image of the Ottonian Bishop', in M. Frassetto (ed.), *The Year 1000: Religious and Social Response to the Turning of the First Millennium* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2002): 85–110.

Warner, D. A. (trans.), *Ottonian Germany: The Chronicon of Thietmar of Merseburg*, Manchester Medieval Sources Series (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001).

Warner, D. A., 'Ritual and Memory in the Ottonian Reich: The Ceremony of *Adventus*', *Speculum*, 76 (2001): 255–83.

White, L. Jr., *Medieval Technology and Social Change* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1962).

White, L. Jr., et al., 'Symposium on the Tenth Century', *Medievalia et Humanistica*, 9 (1955): 1–29.

White, S. D., 'Debate: The "Feudal Revolution" (II)', *Past & Present*, 152 (1996): 205–23.

White, S. D., 'Tenth-Century Courts at Mâcon and the Perils of Structuralist History: Re-Reading Burgundian Judicial Institutions', in W. C. Brown, and P. Górecki (eds.), *Conflict in Medieval Europe: Changing Perspectives on Society and Culture* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2003), 37–68.

Whitney, J. P., (ed.), *The Cambridge Medieval History. Vol. 3: Germany and the Western Empire* (Cambridge UK: Cambridge University Press, 1922).

Wickham, C., 'Debate: The "Feudal Revolution" (IV)', *Past & Present*, 155 (1997): 196–208.

Wickham, C., 'The Other Transition: From the Ancient World to Feudalism', *Past & Present*, 103 (1984): 3–36.

Zimmermann, H., *Das Dunkle Jahrhundert: Ein historisches Porträt* (Graz: Verlag Styria, 1971).

Zimmermann, H. (ed.), *Papsturkunden, 896–1046*, 3 vols., Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Denkschriften, Philosophisch-Historische Klasse, vols. 174, 177, and 198 (Vienna: Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1984–89).

Zimmermann, M., 'Écrire en l'An Mil', in P. Bonnassie and P. Toubert (eds.) *Hommes et sociétés dans l'Europe de l'an mil* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 2004), 351–78.

Re-Forging the 'Age of Iron'

Part II: The Tenth Century in a New Age?

John Howe*
Texas Tech University

Abstract

The tenth century, once dismissed as an unpleasant 'Age of Iron', now receives increased attention as an important age of transition. Historians are attempting to understand how it fits into the broader narrative of Western Civilization. Although some scholars have identified it as the last act of the post-Roman world, others see it as a new age. Perhaps the High Middle Ages with its agricultural and demographic revolution, its new villages and parishes, its revived cities, its reformed churches and schools, and its medieval monarchs began in the tenth century? Or were those changes not novelties of the tenth century but rather manifestations of a 'take off' that had already begun back in the Carolingian Empire, and which, despite the problems posed by late Carolingian wars and invasions, was able to continue, spread, and blossom into the growth and prosperity of the High Middle Ages? New scholarly interest in the tenth century has made it much less of a 'dark age', but scholars still are not quite certain how to conceptualize its historical significance.

Textbooks on Western Civilization normally devote a chapter to 'Europe in the High Middle Ages'. This periodization assumes that after Europe had survived its post-Carolingian crises it began an age of growth lasting several centuries: agriculture expanded, technology advanced, cities multiplied, international trade revived, and Frankish social and political institutions spread to new areas. Chapters on 'The High Middle Ages' attractively describe magnificent churches and castles, fledgling universities, and the 'birth of the state'; they present this period as the highpoint of the whole medieval millennium.

How is the tenth century related to the chapter on the High Middle Ages? Initially, it was the foil, the Dark Age against which Europe's revival could shine more brightly. Yet over the course of the last century the historiographical center of gravity of the High Middle Ages has been subtly sliding backwards. *The Gothic Image* and *The Thirteenth: Greatest of Centuries* glowed less brightly against *The Renaissance of the Twelfth Century*; then the *The Making of the Middle Ages*, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society*, and *The Making of Europe* highlighted the seminal role of the eleventh.[1] As historians continue their (perhaps inadvisable) quest for origins, they confront the possibility that the High Middle Ages began in the tenth century.

According to Robert Fossier, '... almost all the observations which one can make, whatever the preoccupation of individual historians, point to the tenth century as the age of growth, of take-off, of rising, or some such phrase'.[2] To prove this, however, is not easy. One problem is that 'renaissances' and 'golden ages', although they shine brightly enough from a distance, upon closer examination usually prove to be amorphous agglomerations of whatever their inventors considered politicly correct and appealing, supplemented by a few later modifications added by partisans attempting to keep them relevant. Another problem is that the extraordinary prosperity of the High Middle Ages cannot be explained in terms of one or two historical variables, but rather seems to manifest what economists call a 'virtuous cycle', a convergence of multiple positive trends mutually promoted by their interactions. To relate the tenth century to the High Middle Ages

requires item-by-item comparisons that undercut the attempt to comprehend an interrelated totality.

In an earlier article in *History Compass* on 'Reforging the "Age of Iron"', I examined recent efforts to present the tenth century as the end of the ancient world. That model by no means exhausts scholarly creativity. Academics have been developing other ways to place the tenth century into the grand narrative of Western Civilization, models looking more toward the future than the past. They see the tenth century as the birthplace of the High Middle Ages, or, alternatively, as a manifestation of a new Europe that had already begun to take shape back in the Carolingian world. These arguments too deserve analysis.

Tenth-Century Agricultural and Demographic Revival?

Today's historians usually cite agricultural and demographic expansion as the keys to high medieval prosperity, although they hesitate to specify which came first inasmuch as that would involve a classic 'chicken or egg' dilemma concerning whether increased food production led to more people or more people required more food. When did this surge begin? French scholars associated with the journal *Annales* initially assumed it would have started in the mid-eleventh century, but as their research on relatively neglected sources such as place names, field systems, and other marks of rural development progressed, the *Annalistes* found themselves backdating the take-off in particular areas into the tenth or even the late ninth century. To identify a precise point when equilbrium shifted is not easy. Robert Fossier, after summarizing earlier efforts and expressing his own preference for a mid tenth-century demographic revival, nevertheless admitted that, given the thinness of the sources, 'one has to say in all honesty that we can assume but cannot prove'.[3]

Why were there more people? Farmers in the tenth century benefitted from the start of the 'Medieval Warming Period', the milder and drier climate that would characterize the High Middle Ages.[4] New systems of internal fortification increased stability. More efficient (oppressive?) lordship motivated peasants to produce greater surpluses. Agricultural productivity may have benefitted from widespread adoption of technological improvements, a theory popularized by Lynn White Jr., who saw horseshoes, a new horse collar, and a post-invasion shift to heavy plows and the three-field system all leading to 'an agricultural revolution of the early Middle Ages' that 'provided surplus food which, from the tenth century on, permitted rapid urbanization'.[5] White was severely criticized by scholars who claimed that the technological developments he heralded had been adopted much earlier.[6] Nonetheless, on some things he may have been right: tenth-century England, for example, saw the 'decisive' reintroduction and triumph of the heavy plow, a new expansion of arable, more exploitation of water-power, and new Benedictine communities intent on improving their holdings; or again, although the debate on horse equipment has shifted from questions about padded collars and horseshoes to a cluster of technological devices related to carts and plows, evidence does suggest, if not 'revolution', at least tenth-century progress.[7] The tenth century seems to have been a particularly dynamic era, but regional differences militate against any neat 'agricultural revolution'. Because agriculture is inherently bound to the soil, any 'take-offs' must have depended upon very specific geographical, social, and political contexts. Perhaps the most that can be claimed for agricultural progress is that 'the "technological package" of c. 900–1300 coincides with a remarkable period of general growth in the economy'.[8]

A Tenth-Century Revival of Villages, Cities, and Commerce?

The birth of the village has been claimed for the tenth century.[9] Today European villages seem part of a timeless landscape, but their locations frequently conflict with the remains of an earlier rural world of villas and square 'centuriated' fields.[10] Place names suggest that in many regions the ancient landscape had been restructured prior to the year 1000. The tenth-century Mediterranean world saw the effective emergence of nucleated, fortified settlements, although some areas in Spain and Italy began the process earlier and new peripheral settlements would continue to appear in later centuries.[11] In the north, the restructuring was also associated with the process of internal fortification that promoted tighter territorial lordships and concentrated settlements within them. Groups of people could make better use of expensive complicated machinery such as water mills and heavy plows (whose large teams of oxen were more efficient if fields were reorganized into long strips).[12] Larger settlements were able to accommodate specialized craftsmen.[13] Well-anchored villages put an end to the 'settlement mobility' (the tendency of communities to move within their effective areas of exploitation or even to relocate to entirely new areas) which had been characteristic of northern and western European settlements from pre-history through most of the Early Middle Ages.[14]

New villages often became the centers of parishes. The ancient world had had cathedral churches, baptismal churches, and private churches and chapels. Mission regions sometimes developed extended church systems, as in England with its 'ministers' (originally monasteries), which were actually rural collegiate churches administering families of smaller churches and chapels.[15] In the tenth century, parishes began to coalesce, although in many areas it would be well into the thirteenth before the final decisions were made about such aspects of parish organization as the duties of parishoners, the exact locations of parish boundaries, and the rules governing which clergymen could legitimately exercise 'care of souls'. The church was a village's most conspicuous building, and, unlike the more ephemeral peasant houses around it which were continually modified and rebuilt, it was frequently made of stone, signifying permanence and echoing the high civilization of Rome. Parishes and villages sometimes grew up around pre-existing churches or cemeteries. Special chapels or areas in monastic churches could also provide a center.[16] Often the lord himself built the village church, but it could still function as the heart of a parish community so long as villagers identified with it. The parish priest, at his best, was a hinge person who linked the 'little tradition' of the village to the greater traditions of Latin Christendom.[17]

Medieval cities, not the countryside which fed them, were what had originally captured the attention of economic historians. In the lead here was Henri Pirenne, who was convinced that 'the disappearance of trade, in the ninth century, annihilated the last vestiges of city life'; then, however, he saw an increasingly stable, better fortified tenth century which foretold 'in outline the picture which the eleventh century presents' and which witnessed the initial prosperity of trading cities such as Bruges or those along the Rhine.[18] Pirenne focused on the revival of cities in his native Low Countries, but other scholars documented tenth-century urban revivals in Italy,[19] England,[20] and France.[21] The much maligned barbarian invaders actually played an important part, not only by the examples of the entrepôts through which they shipped their own loot but also by the fact that they were more adept at harassing than besieging, which led to their inflicting disproportionate damage on the countrysides and suburbs, thus driving people into walled cities, many of which, archaeology now reveals, actually gained population during the tenth century.[22]

The revival of cities correlates with a revival of trade, a 'European awakening from the tenth century on' that has been labeled a 'commercial revolution'.[23] In the tenth century, the amount of silver in circulation expanded greatly, even in the countryside, a change that probably both reflected and promoted increased trade.[24] Scholars today question the frequently implicit Marxist assumption that nobles in the countryside and merchants in the cities, specialists in antithetical modes of production, were pitted against each other in a zero sum game: rather, rural landholders would naturally have sought advantageous relationships with the new markets; peasant farmers who could produce food for growing cities would prosper as would landlords who found ways to tap their profits.[25] Although most trade was local, exotic products such as silks and spices are easier to document. The West in the tenth century benefitted from the relative prosperity of its Greek and Muslim neighbors. Rising tides float many boats.

A Tenth-Century Revival of the Latin Church?

The tenth century also witnessed a revival of the Latin Church. This is not clear in traditional histories that identify ecclesiastical reform with papal reform. Back in the tenth century, long before the Gregorian Reform party took the field, many initiatives were already underway: unparalleled donations of property to the Church[26]; a great rebuilding of destroyed churches led by kings and nobles[27]; monastic reform movements spearheaded by Cluny, Fleury, and Gorze[28]; diocesan reconstruction led by wealthy and powerful bishops who were both temporal and spiritual leaders[29]; and impressive regional programs such as the England's 'Benedictine Revival'.[30] Today it is becoming increasingly common for scholars to treat the Gregorian Reform not as the beginning of ecclesiastical reform but as its culmination.

The development of schools was one aspect of this ecclesiastical activity. The late tenth century is said to have seen 'the take-off of western schools', a wave of new school foundations far surpassing the relatively few elite centers developed by Charlemagne's top-down court culture.[31] If 'renaissance' is narrowly defined as a self-conscious revival of classical Latin literature, then late tenth-century schools earn the label.[32] Tenth-century pedagogy showed increasing Italian influence, though it remained dominated by the Carolingian intellectual heartland (France, Burgundy, and the Lorraine) and by Carolingian ideals of scholarship.[33] German schools proliferated and were often distinguished.[34] England's 'monastic renaissance' featured learning both in Latin and in the vernacular.[35] Today's scholars also study tenth-century 'creative forgetting', attempting to describe how schoolmen and laymen constructed 'useful' pasts and shaped their histories and archives to fit their goals.[36] The tenth century's monastic and cathedral schools would come to dominate the educational revivals of the eleventh and early twelfth century, creating the milieu from which high medieval universities would ultimately arise.

A New Tenth-Century Europe

In the popular mind, the High Middle Ages is especially associated with the birth of the Ancien Régime, the political and social systems of kings, nobles, offices, courts, ceremonies, and laws that dominated European states up to the French and industrial revolutions and that still remained influential long afterwards. The tenth century, however, may not be the best place to start this story. Scholars who describe a 'feudal revolution' at its end are not claiming the rise of feudal monarchs but rather the triumph of disorderly nobles, castellans, and knights who would have created a culture of violence that would remain

untamed until the twelfth century or later, only after bewildered princes and kings finally got better organized[37] and after lawyers had systematized feudal customs.[38] Governments in the tenth and eleventh centuries did not yet possess the attributes of political cohesion — continuity in space and time, growing legitimacy and authority, claims to loyalty, the ability to guarantee justice and law through financial and juridical institutions staffed by professional bureaucratic personnel–that Joseph Strayer considered essential for 'the origins of the modern state'.[39] In the tenth century, insofar as government tamed chaos, it tended to succeed through elaborate public rituals, what German scholars have labeled 'rules of the game' (*Spielregeln*).[40] This would be so for many centuries. Strayer was able to find emerging states in the twelfth century only because he accepted lordship as government. Scholars who insist on a 'normal conception' of political power 'rooted in practice and distinct from lordship' cannot find much to their liking prior to the spread of Aristotilean political theories in the thirteenth.[41]

The tenth century, nevertheless, was important for today's map of Europe. The disintegration of polities ceased; recognizable prototypes of today's European nation-states emerged. France at the end of the tenth century exhibited 'increasing cohesion', an outcome not predictable at the century's start.[42] German kings maintained the unity of East Francia and established a 'Roman' empire that officially lasted into the nineteenth century.[43] England in the tenth century was transformed into a Carolingian successor state and developed a unified government more centralized than any since the departure of the Roman legions.[44] Monarchical power in the tenth century may have actually benefitted a bit from foreign attacks inasmuch as kings in border regions such as England, Spain, and Germany had the greatest success in retaining control over their military elites. Especially impressive was state formation in northern and eastern Europe, where Norway, Sweden, Denmark, Poland, Bohemia, and Hungary adopted Latin ecclesiastical and governmental structures.[45] These new states had bishops, kings who were crowned 'by the grace of God', legitimate heirs who were ecclesiastically defined, and military institutions increasingly like those of the core Frankish world.[46] The ceremonial aspects of the Ancien Régime developed during the tenth century and become much more prominent in the sources.[47] The tenth century turned late Carolingian experiments with coronation rites into standard procedures widely disseminated through sacramentaries and pontificals.[48]

Another View: The Tenth Century as 'Francia II'

Another perspective on the tenth century, however, places more emphasis on its Carolingian roots. The Carolingian Empire had often been viewed as a dead end. Although Charlemagne himself was such a heroic figure that nationalist historians fought to co-opt him as a proto-French or proto-German king, his empire was far less fascinating because it was so ephemeral and so conceptually different from the nation states that would come to dominate Europe. Carolingian civilization seemed more a last feeble flower of Late Antiquity than the wave of the future.

The world wars of the twentieth century changed things. Competing nation states no longer appeared to be civilization's teleological goal, and, as the Common Market and other Pan-European institutions began to take shape, Charlemagne became acclaimed as 'the father of Europe'.[49] The new interest even extended to the later Carolingians, despite their silly names (Charles the Bald, Charles the Fat, Louis the Stammerer, etc.).[50] Simultaneously, the debates over Henri Pirenne's claim that a Roman Mediterranean had survived the fall of the Roman Empire led to a new

interest in early medieval economic development. The result? Many now claim that it was the Carolingian world that inaugurated Europe's high medieval prosperity. According to the editors of a recent survey,

> Not even a generation ago, scholars located around the year 1000 a series of crucial new directions in the development of European civilization: the demographic upturn after the late Roman decline, the spread of new agricultural techniques and productivity, the beginning of medieval trading centers and circuits, to name only them. All have now been detected closer to 800, or even 700.[51]

Should we then place the medieval 'take off' in the eighth century rather than the tenth and see the tenth century as the unfolding of the Carolingian project? According to this periodization, the Franks revived Western Europe, and, once the barbarian invasions of the late ninth and early tenth centuries had ceased, Frankish civilization spread to an area twice as large as what Charlemagne had ruled and unleashed the dynamic growth cycle that came to characterize the High Middle Ages. To evaluate this model it is necessary to return to the indicators that allegedly marked the tenth century as a 'new world' and to examine in more detail their possible Carolingian antecedents.

Carolingian Agricultural Prosperity?

What about the agricultural and demographic turn around? Even Lynn White Jr had been careful to note the Carolingian roots of the agricultural and technological innovations to which he attributed Europe's resurgence – what he had claimed as distinctive was their more widespread diffusion at the start of the High Middle Ages. Subsequent research, incorporating much more archaeological data, reveals that Carolingian agriculture did already feature varying crop mixtures and systems of animal husbandry, ample use of iron in all sorts of farm tools, and many water mills (63 for the monastery of Saint-Wandrille in 787, 84 for St Germain-des-Prés ca. 825).[52] In the eighth century, manors, often thought to have been static relics of Late Antiquity, were in some cases restructured to separate the lord's fields (the *desmesne*) from peasant holdings, a profound change presumably undertaken for economic and administrative benefits.[53] Some scholars speculate that the decline of slavery began in Carolingian times and correlated with increased productivity, perhaps achieved in part by employing slaves to clear new land and then settling them in place as peasant farmers.[54]

Population trends in the Carolingian world have been inferred from data provided by polyptychs (inventories of estates held by large ecclesiastical institutions). Their testimony has to be carefully evaluated since only about a dozen survive, of which only four contain really detailed demographic information. From these, scholars documented pessimistic, no-growth scenarios, based upon anomalies such as depopulated areas, inefficient population clustering, odd gender and age ratios, and low crop yields. Now revisionists – postulating that the polyptychs undercount women, children, and immigrants – use revised data to support scenarios of 'moderate to considerable ... population growth', perhaps interrupted by sporadic local crises.[55] Questions can be raised about how well a handful of documents from a few mega-monasteries represents the whole Carolingian countryside, but support for population growth also comes from cemetery comparisons and pollen analyses (increased grain pollen from the seventh century onward onward suggests an increase in arable land).[56]

Pirenne's thesis discounted Carolingian towns and cities. As a result, even scholars of the caliber of Georges Duby had a hard time seeing them:

> In the civilization of the ninth and tenth centuries the rural way of life was universal. Entire countries, like England and almost all the Germanic lands, were absolutely without towns. Elsewhere some towns existed: such as the few Roman cities in the south ... But except for some in Lombardy, these 'towns' appear as minute centres of population ...deeply immersed in the surrounding countryside. Indeed they could hardly be distinguished from it.[57]

Subsequent research refutes these claims. True, the Carolingian Empire was overwhelmingly rural, like every other civilization prior to the industrial revolution, but it did have active towns. Although villages and parish structures would not take their final forms until much later, their development would be facilitated by Carolingian capitularies systematizing tithes and establishing standards for rural churches. In some regions, archaeologists have found more evidence for nucleated settlements than dispersed homesteads and have suggested that, during the 'long eighth century' (c. 680–830), antecedent forms of medieval villages became widespread, both inside and outside of manorial structures.[58] Widespread use of metal detectors now reveals networks of sites yielding clusters of lost coins, indicating that rural settlements had economic significance.[59] Mid-level market towns apparently prospered from the late seventh through the early ninth centuries, and may underlie the later urban growth of the High Middle Ages.[60] Major Carolingian emporia, though not always anchored in surrounding urban developments, were part of an expanding trade network.[61] Old Roman cities, including Rome itself, grew thanks in part to the extensive rebuilding of churches promoted by Charlemagne and his successors.[62]

The revival of towns is also related to commerce. The efforts involved in compiling detailed polyptychs for great ecclesiastical estates make sense only if a significant proportion of estate produce was actually sold.[63] Workshop complexes associated with market towns crafted utilitarian items; those connected to monasteries and churches created high quality religious and luxury goods.[64] References to tolls in Carolingian capitularies indicate that merchandise circulated.[65] Tabulations of coin hoards, travel records, and relic attestations reveal that 'Communications between the Frankish empire and the eastern Mediterranean world surged in the final decades of the eighth and the first decades of the ninth century'.[66]

An Afterlife for Carolingian Institutions?

The Frankish Church functioned as a department of government.[67] The dominant theme, strongly promoted by the emperor as an instrument of imperial policy, was 'to align the whole of Carolingian Europe to Rome'.[68] This quest for unity has fascinated scholars, even though it can sometimes be rather limiting as a research perspective.[69] The 'Carolingian Renaissance' has been faulted for its lack of originality, its dependence on the palace, and its extension to perhaps only a few hundred clerks, but it was an enthusiasticly and consistently sponsored revival of learning. On a practical level it provided the foundation of texts, copyists, libraries, and schools that underlay Latin Europe's subsequent cultural development. In the intellectual realm it established the Roman, Christian, and Merovingian sources for government, law, and culture. Its schools would shape tenth-century schools: Ottonian book production, for example, with relatively rare exceptions, does not deviate from the canon of authors the Carolingians established.[70] Carolingian monastic reforms are now seen as directly ancestral to the practices of tenth-century monastic confederations such as Cluny.[71] The Carolingian Renaissance has been hailed as the 'first "renaissance", without which no others would have been possible'.[72]

Sacral kingship in the Latin West built upon Carolingian models. The late ninth century created impressive coronation rituals by amalgamating the traditional secular acclamations of kings with the ecclesiastical anointings introduced by the Carolingians.[73] It inaugurated formal coronation ceremonies for queens.[74] Although Ottonian imperial ideals and concepts differed significantly, they remained deeply indebted to Carolingian precedents[75] In the words of Timothy Reuter (d. 2002), one of the more preeminent historians of Germany, 'To put it at its simplest: they [the Carolingians] invented most of the forms of rulership practiced in pre-French Revolution Europe'.[76]

Whereas Marc Bloch and the early *Annalistes* believed that a new military elite had arisen out of the chaos of the ninth and tenth centuries, careful study by German scholars reveals continuities between the Carolingian aristocracy and the 'new nobility' of the High Middle Ages.[77] Regional studies for Alsace, the Middle Rhine, and Bavaria document not only how aristocratic families continued but also how the power of the Carolingians depended upon their ability to harness the power of local aristocratic factions.[78] Courtly life can be found at Aachen, long before Bruno of Cologne and other Ottonian officials began to foster courtesy and chivalry.[79] Even the ideals of crusade and holy war, which have been presented as tenth- and eleventh-century innovations leading up to the crusades, appear to have had Carolingian antecedents.[80]

Conclusion

Although gross periodization is required by didactic expediency and the need for historical orientation, it always involves some degree of arbitrariness. This becomes clear when we watch scholars attempting to place the tenth century into the right intellectual niche. Part of the problem, of course, is that it was a liminal age, a time of transition. Its lack of any defining central leadership makes it difficult to grasp – no Charlemagne or Gregory VII helps to clarify leading issues and concerns. In fact, centralized structures of any kind are so few and inconsistent that the age's most distinctive feature might be said to be regional fragmentation. In a world that consists of myriads of discrete units, diverse local events must be radically simplified in order to generalize about economic, social, or cultural change. Skeptics can challenge any claim by pointing to geographical outliers well ahead of or behind the curve.

Nevertheless, by examining the competing ways in which scholars have attempted to understand the tenth century, some clarity does emerge. For one thing, despite the tendency of the debaters to formulate opposing positions, much of what they have discovered is actually quite compatible. A Janus-like tenth century can simultaneously look backward to Late Antiquity and forward to the High Middle Ages. At its opening, Carolingian kings and pretenders were still influential and Western Europe was reeling from barbarian attacks; at its close, countrysides were more fortified, rebuilding and restructuring were well underway, and a more recognizable map of Europe had been created. Thus ample supporting evidence is potentially available both for models that stress the old and for those that stress the new. What is most striking is that all scholars formulate their interpretations in the light of the impending dynamism of the High Middle Ages. Where they differ is on exactly how the tenth century relates to that revival. Did it precede it? Start it? Or continue a growth cycle already in progress?

The current status of this debate is exemplified by *The Long Morning of Medieval Europe* (2008), a state-of-the-art book directly concerned with questions of historical periodization. Its authors champion a Carolingian take-off, stealing that honor away from the

tenth century: 'Many features that distinguish the full flowering of medieval civilization in the eleventh and later centuries had in fact begun to develop two or three hundred years earlier than previously perceived'.[81] Not everyone is prepared to accept this back-dating, particularly not French scholars committed to a tenth-century 'feudal mutation' who grudgingly acknowledge the Carolingian world as 'an aborted Europe that nevertheless left behind a legacy' and who can dismiss the Carolingian economy as 'not a particularly interesting topic'.[82] But even scholars who are willing to accept a Carolingian take-off as a provisional model will then be surprised to read: 'When did they [the Early Middle Ages] end? The easy answer is 1000 or at least the eleventh century. By then towns were growing smartly, new forms of art and culture were afoot, and feudalism was triumphing as a political and social force'. Are these distinctives defensible? It is disconcerting that the first two also apply to any of the surrounding centuries and that the third hinges on the 'f-word', for the use of which American medievalists can get their mouths washed out with soap. Whatever claims the editors may make for earlier Frankish achievements, they separate them from the High Middle Ages by adopting this break and restore the tenth century to its transitional role. Discussions about the place of the tenth century are far from over. It is now much less dark, but we still do not know exactly what to do with it.

Short Biography

John Howe studies the ecclesiastical and social history of tenth- through twelfth-century Europe and is now at work on a survey of *The Revival of the Latin Church: The 'Pre-Gregorian' Reform*. He is the author of *Church Reform and Social Change in Eleventh-Century Central Italy: Dominic of Sora and His Patrons* (1997, recipient of the American Catholic Historical Association's John Gilmary Shea Prize in 1998) and editor (with Michael Wolfe) of *Inventing Medieval Landscapes: Senses of Place in Western Europe* (2002). His contributions to historical journals in many countries include hagiographical source criticism, inventories for the German Institute in Paris's project on the *Sources hagiographiques de la Gaule*, studies highlighting ecclesiastical and social changes in central Italy, and historiographical reviews. He earned his doctoral degree from the University of California at Los Angeles (1979). He has taught medieval history at Texas Tech University since 1981, with breaks that include service as a Fellow of the School of Historical Studies at the Institute of Advanced Study, Princeton (2001) and as a Senior Research Associate at the Erasmus Institute at the University of Notre Dame (2003–2004).

Notes

* Correspondence: Department of History, PO Box 41013, Texas Tech University, Lubbock, Texas 79409-1013, United States. Email: john.howe@ttu.edu.

[1] The phrases quoted are taken from titles of representative histories of the High Middle Ages: E. Mâle, *The Gothic Image: Religious Art in France of the Thirteenth Century*, trans. D. Nussey (New York: Harper, 1958) [originally a doctoral dissertation from 1899]; J. J. Walsh, *The Thirteenth, Greatest of Centuries* (New York: Fordham University Press, 1943) [the culmination of a prolific apologetic and academic career begun in the nineteenth century]; C. H. Haskins, *The Renaissance of the Twelfth Century* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1955) [originally 1926; on its influence see R. L. Benson and G. Constable (eds.), *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century* (Cambridge, MA.: Harvard University Press, 1982)]; R. W. Southern, *The Making of the Middle Ages* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953); R. I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Power and Deviance in Western Europe, 950–1250* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1987); R. Bartlett, *The Making of Europe: Conquest, Colonization, and Cultural Change, 950–1350* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993).

[2] R. Fossier, 'Rural Economy and Country Life', in *The New Cambridge Medieval History* [hereafter *NCMH*], 8 vols. (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1995–2005), vol. 3 (1999), 27–63, esp. 27.

[3] Compare M. Bloch, *Feudal Society*, trans. L. A. Manyon, 2 vols. (original 1939, 1940; Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961), vol. 1, 49–71; G. Duby, *The Early Growth of the European Economy*, trans. H. B. Clarke (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1974), 148–59; Fossier, *Enfance de l'Europe: X*–*XII*ᵉ *siècle. Aspects économiques et sociaux*, 2 vols. (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1982), vol. 1, 94–9 and 172. Fossier is quoted from 'Rural Economy and Country Life', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 29.

[4] For data documenting the 'Medieval Warming Period', see M. McCormick, P. E. Dutton, and P. A. Mayewski, 'Volcanoes and the Climate Forcing of Carolingian Europe, A.D. 750–950', *Speculum*, 82 (2007): 865–95, esp. 866–76. In contrast to top-down climatic research, archeological studies can reveal specific changes in specific environments; see, for example, M. Colardelle and É. Verdel, 'Les sociétés de l'An Mil: Quelques apports et questionnements de l'archéologie', and A. Durand, 'Les milieux naturels autour de l'An Mil: Approches paléoenvironnementales méditerranéennes', in P. Bonnassie and P. Toubert (eds.) *Hommes et sociétés dans l'Europe de l'an mil* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 2004), esp. 56–59, and 73–100, esp. 73–81.

[5] L. White Jr, *Medieval Technology and Social Change* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1962), 58–59, 61, 74, 78.

[6] P. H. Sawyer and R. H. Hilton, 'Technical Determinism: The Stirrup and the Plough', *Past & Present*, 24 (1963): 90–100 (a notoriously *ad hominem* review). For more sympathetic appraisals of what White did and did not accomplish, see B. Hall, 'Lynn White's *Medieval Technology and Social Change* after Thirty Years', in R. Fox (ed.), *Technological Change: Methods and Themes in the History of Technology* (Amsterdam: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1996), 85–101; A. Roland, 'Once More into the Stirrups: Lynn White Jr., *Medieval Technology and Social Change*', *Technology and Culture*, 44 (2003): 574–85; and S. Worthen, 'The Influence of Lynn White Jr.'s *Medieval Technology and Social Change*', *History Compass* (June 30, 2009): 1201–17.

[7] G. Raepsaet, 'The Development of Farming Implements between the Seine and the Rhine from the Second to the Twelfth Centuries', in G. Astill and J. Langdon (eds.), *Medieval Farming and Technology: The Impact of Agricultural Change in Northwest Europe*, Technology and Change in History, vol. 1 (Leiden: Brill, 1997), 41–68; P. Fowler, *Farming in the First Millennium AD: British Agriculture between Julius Caesar and William the Conqueror* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2002), esp. 16, 203, and 290–3; C. Rommelaere and Raepsaet, 'Les techniques de traction animale de l'Antiquité au Moyen Âge', in M. Barceló and F. Sigaut (eds.), *The Making of Feudal Agricultures?* The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 13 (Leiden: Brill, 2004), 121–30.

[8] C. Dyer, 'Medieval Farming and Technology: Conclusion', in Astill and Langdon (eds.), *Medieval Farming and Technology*, 294–312, esp. 302.

[9] Fossier, *Enfance de l'Europe*, 288–89; D. Pichot, 'Le village, une nouveauté?' in *Le Village éclaté: Habitat et société dans les campagnes de l'Ouest au Moyen Âge* (Rennes: Presses universitaires de Rennes, 2002), 59–112.

[10] F. Cheyette, 'The Origins of European Villages and the First European Expansion', *The Journal of Economic History*, 37 (1977): 182–206.

[11] P. Arthur, 'From *Vicus* to Village: Italian Landscapes, AD 400–1000', in N. Christie (ed.), *Landscapes of Change: Rural Evolutions in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 2004), 103–33, esp. 119–22.

[12] P. Périn, 'La part du Haut Moyen Âge dans la genèse des terroirs de la France médiévale', in M. Parisse and X. Barral i Altet (eds.), *Le Roi de France et son Royaume autour de l'an mil: Actes du colloque Hugues Capet 987–1987, La France de l'an Mil, Paris – Senlis, 22–25 juin 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1992), 225–33; Fossier, 'Rural Economy and Country Life', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 41–7 and 62–3.

[13] R. Hodges, 'Society, Power and the First English Industrial Revolution', in *Il Secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19–25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), vol. 1, 125–57, esp. 146–7.

[14] H. Hamerow, *Early Medieval Settlements: The Archaeology of Rural Communities in North-West Europe, 400–900* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 104–106.

[15] J. Blair, 'Introduction: From Minster to Parish Church', in Blair (ed.), *Minsters and Parish Churches: The Local Church in Transition, 950–1050*, Oxford University Committee for Archaeology Monograph, vol. 17 (Oxford: Oxford University Committee for Archaeology, 1988), 1–19; Blair, *The Church in Anglo-Saxon Society* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), 368–504.

[16] G. Rosser, 'The Cure of Souls in English Towns before 1000', in Blair and R. Sharpe (eds.), *Pastoral Care before the Parish* (Leicester: Leicester University Press, 1992), 267–84, esp. 270–4.

[17] *Le istituzioni ecclesiastiche della 'Societas Christiana' dei secoli XI–XII: Diocesi, pievi e parrocchie: Atti della sesta Settimana internazionale di studio, Milano, 1–7 settembre 1974*, Pubblicazioni dell'Università cattolica del Sacro Cuore. Miscellanea del Centro di studi medioevali, vol. 8 (Milan: Vita e Pensiero, 1977); Bonnassie, 'Le clergé paroissal aux IXᵉ–Xᵉ siècles dans les Pyrénéees orientales et centrales', in his *Le clergé rural dans l'Europe médiévale et moderne (Actes des XIIIᵉ Journées Internationales d'histoire de Flaran* (Toulouse: P.U.M., 1995), 153–66 and 269–83 repr. with comments and a 'Bibliographie complémentaire' in his *Les Sociétés de l'an mil: Un monde entre deux âges* (Brussels: De Boeck & Larcier, 2001), 269–83.

[18] H. Pirenne, *Medieval Cities: Their Origins and the Revival of Trade*, trans. F. D. Halsey (1925, repr. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1958), 42, 65, 77–9; A. Verhulst, *The Rise of Cities in North-West Europe*, Themes in International Urban History, vol. 4 (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1999), 68–118.

[19] R. Bordone, 'La città nel secolo X', in *Il Secolo di ferro*, vol. 1, 517–59; C. La Rocca, 'Perceptions of an Early Medieval Urban Landscape', in P. Linehan and J. Nelson (eds.), *The Medieval World* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 416–31, esp. 427–39.

[20] M. Biddle, 'The Development of the Anglo-Saxon Town', in *Topografia urbana e vita cittadina nell'alto medioevo in occidente, 26 aprile – 1 maggio, 1973*, 2 vols. Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 21 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1974), vol. 1, 203–230, esp. 204 and 228–30; Bordone, 'La città nel X secolo', in *Il Secolo di ferro*, vol. 1, 517–59; D. G. Russo, *Town Origins and Development in Early England, c. 400–950 A.D.* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1998), 233.

[21] L. Musset, 'La renaissance urbaine des Xe et XIe siècles dans l'ouest de la France: Problèmes et hypothèses de travail', in *Études de civilisation médiévale, IXe-XIIe siècles: Mélanges offerts à Edmond-René Labande à l'occasion de son départ à la retraite et du XXe anniversaire du C.E.S.C.M.* (Poitiers: C. E.S.C.M, 1974), 563–75, repr. in his *Nordica et Normannica: Recueil d'études sur la Scandinavie ancienne et médiévale, les expéditions des Vikings et la fondation de la Normandie*, Studia nordica, vol. 1 (Paris: Société des études nordiques, 1997), 361–76.

[22] M. Rouche, 'The Vikings versus the Towns of Northern Gaul: Challenge and Response', in C. L. Redman (ed.), *Medieval Archaeology: Papers of the Seventeenth Annual Conference of the Center for Medieval and Early Renaissance Studies*, Medieval & Renaissance Texts & Studies, vol. 60 (Binghamton, NY: SUNY, 1989), 41–56; L. Olson, *The Early Middle Ages: The Birth of Europe* (New York: Macmillan Palgrave, 2007), 132–37.

[23] R. S. Lopez, *The Commercial Revolution of the Middle Ages, 950–1350* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1976), 25 (quoted in the text).

[24] F. Dumas, *Le trésor de Fécamp et le monnayage en Francie occidentale pendant la seconde moitié du Xe siècle* (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, 1971); Dumas, 'La monnaie au Xe siècle', in *Il secolo di ferro*, vol. 2, 564–614; M. F. Hendy, 'East and West: Divergent Models of Coinage and Its Use', in *Ibid.*, vol. 2, 637–79, esp. 640, 660–1, and 673–4; Fossier, 'Silver Arrives in the Countryside', in 'Rural Economy and Country Life', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 60–3; P. Johanek, 'Merchants, Markets and Towns', in *Ibid.*, 64–94, esp. 66–9.

[25] R. G. Witt, 'The Landlord and the Economic Revival of the Middle Ages in Northern Europe, 1000–1250', *American Historical Review*, 76 (1971): 965–88.

[26] D. Herlihy, 'Church Property on the European Continent, 701–1200', *Speculum*, 36 (1961): 81–105, esp. 95–7; Duby, *Early Growth of the European Economy*, 165–6; F. Bougard, 'Actes privés et transferts patrimoniaux en Italie centro-septentrionale (VIIIe-Xe siècle)', in *Les transferts patrimoniaux en Europe occidentale, VIIIeme-Xeme siècle (I). Actes de la table ronde de Rome, 6, 7 et 8 mai 1999*, in *Mélanges de l'École française de Rome – moyen âge*, 3 (1999): 539–62, esp. 542 and 559–62.

[27] J. Howe, 'The Nobility's Reform of the Medieval Church', *American Historical Review*, 93 (1988): 317–39.

[28] Monastic reform is surveyed in U.-R. Blumenthal, *The Investiture Controversy: Church and Monarchy from the Ninth to the Twelfth Century* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988), 1–27; J. Wollasch, 'Monasticism: The First Wave of Reform', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 163–85. On Cluny, see B. H. Rosenwein, *Rhinoceros Bound: Cluny in the Tenth Century* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1982); Rosenwein, *To Be the Neighbor of Saint Peter: The Social Meaning of Cluny's Property, 909–1049* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1989); G. Constable, 'Cluny in the Monastic World of the Tenth Century', in *Il Secolo di ferro*, vol. 1, 391–448; Constable, G. Melville, and J. Oberste (eds.), *Die Cluniazenser in ihrem politisch-sozialen Umfeld*, Vita Regularis, vol. 7 (Munich: LIT Verlag, 1998); Iogna-Prat, *Études clunisiennes* (Paris: Picard, 2002). On German reforms, see K. Hallinger, *Gorze-Kluny. Studien zu den monastischen Lebensformen und Gegensätzen im Hochmittelalter*, 2 vols. Studia Anselmiana, vols. 22–25 (Rome: Herder, 1950–51); M. Parisse, 'Noblesse et monastères en Lotharingie du IXe au XIe siècle', in R. Kottje and H. Maurer (eds.), *Monastische Reformen im 9. und 10. Jahrhundert*, Vorträge und Forschungen, vol. 38 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke Verlag, 1989), 167–96; J. Nightingale, *Monasteries and Patrons in the Gorze Reform: Lotharingia c. 850–1000* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2001).

[29] T. Reuter, 'The "Imperial Church System" of the Ottonian and Salian Rulers: A Reconsideration', *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 33 (1982): 347–74, repr. in his *Medieval Polities and Modern Mentalities*, ed. J. L. Nelson (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006). 325–54; Parisse, 'Princes laïques et/ou moines, les évêques du Xe siècle', in *Il Secolo di ferro*, vol. 1, 449–516; Blumenthal, *Investiture Controversy*, 28–65; McKitterick, 'The Church', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 130–62, esp. 142–51.

[30] C. E. Lutz, *Schoolmasters of the Tenth Century* (Hamden, CT: Archon Books, 1977); D. A. Bullough, 'The Continental Background of the Reform', in D. Parsons (ed.), *Tenth-Century Studies: Essays in Commemoration of the Millennium of the Council of Winchester and Regularis Concordia* (London: Phillimore, 1975), 20–36 and 210–14, repr. in his *Carolingian Renewal: Sources and Heritage* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1991); G. H. Brown, 'The Anglo-Saxon Monastic Revival', in W. Treadgold (ed.), *Renaissances before the Renaissance: Cultural Revivals of Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1984), 99–113; C. Cubitt, 'The Tenth-Century Benedictine Reform in England', *Early Medieval Europe*, 6 (1997): 77–94.

[31] P. Riché, 'Essor des écoles occidentales: Milieux X⁰ – milieu XI⁰ siècle', in *Écoles et enseignement dans le haut moyen âge: Fin du V⁰ siècle-milieu du XI⁰ siècle* (Paris: Aubier Montaigne, 1979), 119–36.

[32] Riché, 'La 'Renaissance' intellectuelle du X⁰ siècle en Occident', *Cahiers d'histoire*, 21 (1976): 27–42, repr. in Riché, *Instruction et vie religieuse dans le Haut Moyen Age*, Collected Studies, vol. 139 (London: Variorum Reprints, 1981); Riché, 'Les lettrés du X⁰ siècle et l'histoire de Rome', in E. Baumgartner (ed.), *Le nombre du temps: En hommage à Paul Zumthor* (Paris: Champion Slatkin, 1988), 115–23, repr. in Riché, *Education et Culture dans l'Occident médiéval*, Collected Studies Series, vol. 420 (Aldershot, Hampshire: Variorum, 1993) [same pagination]; J.-Y. Tilliette, 'Le X⁰ siècle dans l'histoire de la littérature', in D. Iogna-Prat and J. C. Picard (eds.), *Religion et culture autour de l'an Mil. Royaume capétien et Lotharingie: Actes du Colloque Hugues Capet 987–1987, la France de l'an Mil, Auxerre, 26 et 27 juin 1987 – Metz, 11 et 12 septembre 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1990), 93–8.

[33] C. M. Radding, 'The Geography of Learning in Early Eleventh-Century Europe: Lanfranc of Bec and Berengar of Tours Revisited', *Bullettino dell'Istituto storico italiano per il Medio Evo*, 98 (1992): 145–72, esp. 147–8; C. S. Jaeger, *The Envy of Angels: Cathedral Schools and Social Ideals in Medieval Europe, 950–1200* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994), 16–17; C. Leonardi, 'Intellectual Life', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 186–211, esp. 188 and 194.

[34] J. Fleckenstein, 'Königshof und Bischofsschule unter Otto dem Grossen', *Archiv für Kulturgeschichte*, 38 (1956): 38–62, repr. in his *Ordnungen und formende Kräfte des Mittelalters: Ausgewählte Beiträge* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1989), 168–92; Ehlers, 'Dom- und Klosterschulen in Deutschland und Frankreich im 10. und 11. Jahrhundert', in M. Kintzinger, S. Lorenz, and M. Walter (eds.), *Schule und Schüler im Mittelalter: Beiträge zur europäischen Bildungsgeschichte des 9. bis 15. Jahrhunderts*, Beihefte zum Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, vol. 42 (Cologne: Böhlau, 1996), 29–59; J. Staub, 'Domschulen am Mittelrhein um und nach 1000', in W. Hartmann (ed.), *Bischof Burchard von Worms, 1000–1025*, Quellen und Abhandlungen zur mittelrheinischen Kirchengeschichte, vol. 100 (Mainz: Selbsverlag der Gesellschaft für mittelrheinische Kirchengschichte, 2000), 279–309.

[35] M. Lapidge, 'Schools, Learning and Literature in Tenth-Century England', in *Il Secolo di ferro*, vol. 2, 951–1005.

[36] P. J. Geary, *Phantoms of Remembrance: Memory and Oblivion at the End of the First Millennium* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994); E. Van Houts, *Memory and Gender in Medieval Europe, 900–1300* (London: MacMillan, 1999); and Geary, 'Monastic Memory and the Mutation of the Year Thousand', in S. Farmer and B. H. Rosenwein (eds.), *Monks and Nuns, Saints and Outcasts: Religion in Medieval Society. Essays in Honor of Lester K. Little* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2000), 19–36; Geary, 'Oblivion between Orality and Textuality in the Tenth Century', in Althoff, Fried, and Geary (eds.), *Medieval Concepts of the Past: Ritual, Memory, Historiography* (Washington, DC: German Historical Institute, 2002), 111–122.

[37] T. N. Bisson, *The Crisis of the Twelfth Century: Power, Lordship, and the Origins of European Government* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2009), 22–83.

[38] S. Reynolds, *Fiefs and Vassals: The Medieval Evidence Reinterpreted* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994), makes the case for a systematic development of 'feudal law' only in the twelfth century and later.

[39] J. R. Strayer, *On the Medieval Origins of the Modern State* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1970), esp. 34–35.

[40] G. Althoff, *Spielregeln der Politik im Mittelalter: Kommunikation in Frieden und Fehde* (Darmstadt: Primus, 1997), and *Die Macht der Rituale: Symbolik und Herrschaft im Mittelalter* (Darmstadt: Primus, 2003); P. Buc, *The Dangers of Ritual: Between Early Medieval Texts and Social Scientific Theory* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001).

[41] Bisson, *Crisis of the Twelfth Century*, 489–94.

[42] J. Dunbabin, 'West Francia: The Kingdom', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 372–97, esp. 372 and 397.

[43] K. Leyser, *Rule and Conflict in an Early Medieval Society: Ottonian Saxony* (London: Arnold, 1979); Reuter, *Germany in the Early Middle Ages, c. 800–1056* (London: Longman, 1991). For tenth-century Germany as potentially fissiparous, see Reuter, 'The Making of England and Germany, 850–1050: Points of Comparison and Difference', in A. P. Smyth (ed.), *Medieval Europeans: Studies in Ethnic Identity and National Perspectives in Medieval Europe* (London: Macmillan Press, 1998), 53–70, esp. 54–55, repr. in Reuter, *Medieval Polities*, 284–99.

[44] For England as a 'Carolingian state', see J. Campbell, 'Observations on English Government from the Tenth to the Twelfth Century', *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 5th ser., 25 (1975): 39–54, repr. in his *Essays in Anglo-Saxon History* (London: Hambledon Press, 1986), 155–70; H. R. Loyn, 'Church and State in England in the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries', in Parsons (ed.), *Tenth-Century Studies*, 94–102 and 229–30. For examples of tenth-century secular connections with the Frankish world, see MacLean, 'Making a Difference in Tenth-Century Politics: King Athelstan's Sisters and Frankish Queenship', in P. Fouracre and D. Ganz (eds.), *Frankland: The Franks and the World of the Early Middle Ages: Essays in Honour of Dame Jinty Nelson* (Manchester: Manchester University Press 2008), 167–90; for tenth-century ecclesiastical connections see D. A. Bullough, 'The Continental Background of the Tenth-Century English Reform', in Parsons (ed.), *Tenth-Century Studies*, 20–36 and 210–14, repr. in his *Carolingian Renewal: Sources and Heritage* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1991), 272–96. Note that S. Keynes, 'England, 900–1016', is a study presented in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 456–84, in the section on 'Post-Carolingian Europe', not in the section on 'Non-Carolingian Europe'.

[45] H. Wolfram, 'New Peoples around the Year 1000', in P. Urbańczyk (ed.), *Europe around the Year 1000* (Warsaw: Polish Academy of Sciences Institute of Archaeology and Ethnology, 2001), 391–408; M. Font, 'Missions,

Conversions, and Power Legitimization in East Central Europe at the Turn of the First Millennium', in F. Curta (ed.), *East Central & Eastern Europe in the Early Middle Ages* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005), 283–96; Curta, 'Iron Century or Golden Age (900–1000)', in his *Southeastern Europe in the Middle Ages, 500–1250* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 178–247. On the complex issues related to new 'national identities', see I. H. Garipzanov, Geary, and Urbańczyk (eds.), *Franks, Northmen, and Slavs: Identities and State Formation in Early Medieval Europe*, Cursor mundi, vol. 5 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008).

[46] On the spread of structures from Europe's core to its peripheries, see especially Bartlett, *Making of Europe*.

[47] K. Leyser, 'Ritual, Ceremony, and Gesture: Ottonian Germany', *Communications and Power*, 1, 189–213, esp. 192–3; Buc, 'Political Rituals and Political Imagination in the Medieval West from the Fourth Century to the Eleventh', in Linehan and Nelson, *Medieval World*, 189–213, esp. 194 and 198–9.

[48] For the development of coronation *ordines*, see R. A. Jackson, 'General Introduction', *Ordines Coronationis Franciae: Texts and Ordines for the Coronation of Frankish and French Kings and Queens in the Middle Ages*, 2 vols. (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995 and 2000), vol. 1, 21–30. Most of the ceremonial innovations are actually ninth century, but the tenth does see blessings elaborated for all items associated with kingship: see R.-H. Bautier, 'Sacres et couronnements sous les carolingiens et les premiers capétiens: Recherches sur la genèse du sacre royale français', *Annuaire-bulletin de la Société de l'histoire de France* (1987): 7–56, esp. 49–50.

[49] Charlemagne is now universally represented as a trans-European figure. Recent treatments include Ehlers, *Charlemagne, l'Européen entre la France et l'Allemagne: Bibliothèque historique de la Ville de Paris, le 6 octobre 2000*, Conférences annuelles de l'Institut historique allemand, vol. 7 (Stuttgart: Jan Thorbecke, 2001); A. Barbero, *Charlemagne: Father of a Continent*, trans. A. Cameron (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004); Nelson, 'Charlemagne: "Father of Europe"?' *Quaestiones Medii Aevi Novae*, 7 (2002): 3–20, repr. in Nelson, *Courts, Elites, and Gendered Power in the Early Middle Ages: Charlemagne and Others*, Variorum Collected Studies Series, vol. 878 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2007) [same pagination]; and McKitterick, *Charlemagne: The Formation of a European Identity* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008). Both the nationalist and the universalist images of Charlemagne have medieval precedents: see Reuter, 'The Ottonians and Carolingian Tradition', in his *Medieval Polities*, 268–83, esp. 271–73 and 279; and M. Gabriele and J. Stuckey (eds.), *The Legend of Charlemagne in the Middle Ages: Power, Faith, and Crusade* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008).

[50] G. Barraclough, *The Crucible of Europe: The Ninth and Tenth Centuries in European History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976); R. McKitterick, *The Frankish Kingdoms under the Carolingians, 751–987* (London: Longman, 1983); E. Hlawitschka, *Vom Frankenreich zur Formierung der europäischen Staaten- und Völkergemeinschaft, 840–1046: Ein Studienbuch zur Zeit der späten Karolinger, der Ottonen und der frühen Salier in der Geschichte Mitteleuropas* (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1986); Nelson, *Charles the Bald* (London: Longman, 1992); Riché, *The Carolingians: A Family Who Forged Europe*, trans. M. I. Allen (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1993); P. Godman and R. Collins (eds.), *Charlemagne's Heir: New Perspectives on the Reign of Louis the Pious* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990).

[51] J. R. Davis and M. McCormick, 'The Early Middle Ages: Europe's Long Morning', in Davis and McCormick (eds.), *The Long Morning of Medieval Europe: New Directions in Early Medieval Studies* (Aldershot, UK: Ashgate, 2008), 1–10, esp. 1.

[52] Verhulst, *The Carolingian Economy* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 61–71; P. Reigniez, 'Histoire et techniques: L'outil agricole dans la période du Haut Moyen Âge', in M. Barceló et al. *The Making of Feudal Agricultures?* 33–120, esp. 87–109.

[53] Toubert, 'Le part du grand domaine dans le décollage économique de l'Occident (VIIIe–Xe siècles)', in *La croissance agricole du Haut Moyen Âge: Chronologie, modalités, géographie. Centre culturel de l'Abbaye de Flaran: Dixièmes journées internationales d'histoire, 9, 10, 11 septembre 1988*, Flaran, vol. 10 (Auch: Comité départemental de tourisme du Gers, 1990), 53–86; Verhulst, *Carolingian Economy*, 33–37 and 49–57; Toubert, *L'Europe dans sa première croissance: De Charlemagne à l'an mil* (Paris: Fayard, 2004), 27–72; C. Wickham, *Framing the Middle Ages: Europe and the Mediterranean, 400–800* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), 288–301.

[54] Bonnassie, 'La croissance agricole du haut Moyen Âge dans la Gaule du Midi et le Nord-est de la Péninsule ibérique: chronologie, modalités, limites', in *La croissance agricole*, 13–35; repr. with some comments and a 'Bibliographie complémentaire' in his *Les Sociétés de l'an mil*, 169–97; J. Henning, 'Slavery or Freedom? The Causes of Early Medieval Europe's Economic Advancement', *Early Medieval Europe*, 12 (2003): 269–77; and Henning, 'Strong Rulers – Weak Economy? Rome, the Carolingians and the Archaeology of Slavery in the First Millennium AD', in Davis and McCormick (eds.), *Long Morning of Medieval Europe*, 33–53 (a study which views the Carolingian bipartite estate as regressive and inefficient, but postulates a connection between freedom and a decline in desmesne production allegedly underway by the tenth century).

[55] G. Duby, *Rural Economy and Country Life in the Medieval West*, trans C. Postan (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1968), 11–15; Verhulst, *Carolingian Economy*, 23–28, 37–40, and 127–28; Toubert, *L'Europe dans sa première croissance*, 9–12, 42–8.

[56] Verhulst, *Carolingian Economy*, 26–27.

[57] Duby, *Rural Economy*, 5.

[58] Hamerow, *Early Medieval Settlements*, 52–99 and 191–2; Périn, 'The Origin of the Village in Early Medieval Gaul', in Christie (ed.), *Landscapes of Change*, 255–78; Wickham, *Framing the Middle Ages*, 383–515; R. Francovich, 'The Beginnings of Hilltop Villages in Early Medieval Tuscany', in Davis and McCormick (eds.), *Long Morning of Medieval Europe*, 55–82.

[59] K. Ulmschneider and T. Pestell, 'Introduction: Early Medieval Markets and "Productive" Sites', in Pestell and Ulmschneider (eds.), *Markets in Early Medieval Europe: Trading and Productive Sites, 650–850* (Macclesfield, Cheshire: Windgather Press, 2003), 1–10, present the history of research on loose coin finds, which has been pursued more systematically in the United Kingdom than on the Continent.

[60] Biddle, 'The Development of the Anglo-Saxon Town', 212–21; R. Hodges, *Dark Age Economics: The Origins of Towns and Trade, A.D. 600–1000* (New York: St Martin's Press, 1982), esp. 162–94; Verhulst, *Rise of Cities in North-West Europe*, 132–35.

[61] R. Hodges and B. Hobley (eds.), *The Rebirth of Towns in the West, AD 700–1050*, Council for British Archaeology Research Report, vol. 68 (London: CBA, 1960), offers reports on many towns, esp. on British sites. See also R. Hodges, '*Dark Age Economics* Revisited', in H. Sarfati, W. J. H. Verwers, and P. J. Woltering (eds.), *Discussion with the Past: Archaeological Studies Presented to W. A. van Es* (Zwolle: ROB, 1999), 227–32, repr. in R. Hodges, *Goodbye to the Vikings? Re-reading Early Medieval Archaeology* (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co., 2006), 63–71; and his *Towns and Trade in the Age of Charlemagne* (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co., 2000), 76–92.

[62] P. Delogu, 'The Rebirth of Rome in the 8th and 9th Centuries', in R. Hodges and B. Hobley (eds.), *Rebirth of Towns*, 32–42; R. Krautheimer, *Rome Profile of a City, 312–1308* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1980), 109–42; Hodges, *Towns and Trade*, 55–64.

[63] Wickham, 'Rethinking the Structure of the Early Medieval Economy', in Davis and McCormick (eds.), *Long Morning of Medieval Europe*, 19–31.

[64] Hodges, *Dark Age Economics*, 104–29; Hamerow, *Early Medieval Settlements*, 172–90; Henning, 'Strong Rulers – Weak Economy?' 51–52. On one of the most extensively excavated workshop complexes, see Hodges, *Light in the Dark Ages: The Rise and Fall of San Vincenzo al Volturno* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1997), 94–101; and M. Moran, 'San Vincenzo in the Making: The Discovery of an Early Medieval Production Site on the East Bank of the Volturno', in Pestell and Ulmschneider (eds.), *Markets in Early Medieval Europe*, 248–63.

[65] J. Durliat, *Les finances publiques de Dioclétien aux Carolingiens (284–889)* (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke, 1990), 216–17.

[66] M. McCormick, *Origins of the European Economy: Communications and Commerce, A.D. 300–900* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 442.

[67] Durliat, *Finances publiques*, 246–8, describes financial connections; Bullough, 'Texts, Chant, and the Chapel of Louis the Pious', in Godman and Collins (eds.), *Charlemagne's Heir*, 489–508, repr. in his *Carolingian Renewal*, 241–71.

[68] The quotation from McKitterick, *Charlemagne*, 380, reflects general research tendencies. For example, *Nascita dell'Europa ed Europa carolingia: Un'equazione da verificare*, Settimane di studi del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 27 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1981) contains six contributions in its section on 'La Cultura', five of which invoke the quest for unity in their titles (vol. 1, 459–530; vol. 2, 531–818). See also McKitterick, *Charlemagne*, 136 and 292–380.

[69] On the constraining effects of this paradigm, see R. E. Sullivan, 'The Carolingian Age: Reflections on Its Place in the History of the Middle Ages', *Speculum*, 64 (1989): 273–8. J. M. Wallace-Hadrill, *The Frankish Church* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1983) offers an implicit criticism by adopting a longer time frame.

[70] R. McKitterick, 'Continuity and Innovation in Tenth-Century Ottonian Culture', in L. Smith and B. Ward (eds.), *Intellectual Life in the Middle Ages: Essays Presented to Margaret Gibson* (London: The Hambledon Press, 1992), 15–24, esp. 24.

[71] C. B. Bouchard, 'Merovingian, Carolingian, and Cluniac Monasticism: Reform and Renewal in Burgundy', *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 41 (1990): 365–88; for Carolinigan influence on the English monastic revival, see Bullough, 'Continental Background of the Tenth-Century English Reform', 20–36 and 210–14.

[72] P. Wolfe, *The Awakening of Europe*, Pelican History of European Thought, vol. 1 (New York: Penguin Books, 1968), 106.

[73] Leyser, 'Sacral Kingship', in *Rule and Conflict*, 75–107; Bautier, 'Sacres et couronnements', 7–56; Jackson, 'General Introduction', *Ordines Coronationis Franciae*, vol. 1, 21–30. For a case study of Carolingian king-making in transition, see Nelson, 'Hincmar of Reims on King-Making', in Bak (ed.), *Coronations*, 16–34; Y. Hen, *The Royal Patronage of Liturgy in Frankish Gaul to the Death of Charles the Bald*, Henry Bradshaw Society Subsidia, vol. 3 (London: Boydell Press, 2001), esp. 16–19, 81–83, 120–46.

[74] J. Nelson, 'Early Medieval Rites of Queen-Making and the Shaping of Medieval Queenship', in Duggan (ed.), *Queens and Queenship in Medieval Europe: Proceedings of a Conference Held at Queen's College London, April 1995* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell & Brewer, 1997), 301–15, repr. in her *Rulers and Ruling Families in Early Medieval Europe*, Variorum Collected Studies Series, vol. 657 (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Company, 1999) [same pagination]; J. A. Smith, 'The Earliest Queen-Making Rites', *Church History*, 66 (1997): 18–35.

[75] J. Muldoon, *Empire and Order: The Concept of Empire, 800–1800* (New York: St Martin's Press, 1999), 21–35; Reuter, 'The Ottonians and Carolingian Tradition', 268–83.

[76] Reuter, 'The Ottonians and Carolingian Tradition', 271.

[77] K. Leyser, 'The German Aristocracy from the Ninth to the Early Twelfth Century: A Historical and Cultural Sketch', *Past & Present*, 41 (1968): 25–53; R. Le Jan, 'Continuity and Change in the Tenth-Century Nobility', in Duggan (ed.), *Nobles and Nobility in Medieval Europe: Concepts, Origins, Transformations* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: The Boydell Press, 2000), 53–68.

[78] H. J. Hummer, *Politics and Power in Early Medieval Europe: Alsace and the Frankish Realm, 600–1000*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th ser., vol. 65 (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2005); M. Innes, *State and Society in the Early Middle Ages: The Middle Rhine Valley, 400–1000*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th ser., vol. 47 (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000); W. C. Brown, *Unjust Seizure: Conflict, Interest, and Authority in an Early Medieval Society* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2001).

[79] Nelson, 'Was Charlemagne's Court a Courtly Society?' in Cubitt (ed.), *Court Culture in the Early Middle Age: The Proceedings of the First Alcuin Conference* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003), 39–57, repr. in Nelson, *Courts, Elites, and Gendered Power* [same pagination]; Innes, '"A Place of Discipline": Carolingian Courts and Aristocratic Youth', in Cubitt (ed.), *Court Culture*, 59–76, Hen, *Roman Barbarians: The Royal Court and Culture in the Early Medieval West* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), 180, sees the Carolingian court as a direct continuation of Late Roman courtly practice as transmitted through earlier post-Roman kingdoms.

[80] McCormick, 'Liturgie et guerre des Carolingiens à la première croisade', in *'Militia Christi' e Crociata nei secoli XI-XIII: Atti della undecima Settimana internazionale di studio, Mendola, 1989, 28 agosto – 1 settembre 1989*, Miscellanea del Centro di studi medioevali, vol. 13 (Milan: Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, 1992), 209–40; Le Jan, 'Frankish Giving of Arms and Rituals of Power: Continuity and Change in the Carolingian Period', in F. Theuws and Nelson (eds.), *Rituals of Power: From Late Antiquity to the Early Middle Ages*, The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 8 (Leiden: Brill, 2000), 281–309.

[81] Davis and McCormick, 'The Early Middle Ages', 1.

[82] For skepticism about the extent of a Carolingian economic revival, see Duby, *Early Growth of the European Economy*, 98–111; and Fossier, 'Les tendances de l'économie: Stagnation ou croissance?' in *Nascita dell'Europa*, vol. 1, 261–90. The quotations are from J. Le Goff, *The Birth of Europe*, trans. J. Lloyd (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005), 13 and 29, and Fossier, 'Rural Economy and Country Life', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 27–63, esp. 29.

Bibliography

Althoff, G., *Die Macht der Rituale: Symbolik und Herrschaft im Mittelalter* (Darmstadt: Primus, 2003).

Althoff, G., *Spielregeln der Politik im Mittelalter: Kommunikation in Frieden und Fehde* (Darmstadt: Primus, 1997).

Althoff, G., Fried, J., and Geary, P. (eds.), *Medieval Concepts of the Past: Ritual, Memory, Historiography* (Washington, DC: German Historical Instiotute, 2002).

Arthur, P., 'From *Vicus* to Village: Italian Landscapes, AD 400–1000', in N. Christie (ed.), *Landscapes of Change: Rural Evolutions in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 2004), 103–33.

Astill, G., and Langdon J. (eds.), *Medieval Farming and Technology: The Impact of Agricultural Change in Northwest Europe*, Technology and Change in History, vol. 1 (Leiden: Brill, 1997).

Bak, J. M. (ed.), *Coronations: Medieval and Early Modern Monarchic Ritual* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990).

Barbero, A., *Charlemagne: Father of a Continent*, trans. A. Cameron (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004).

Barceló, M., and Sigaut, F. (eds.), *The Making of Feudal Agricultures?* The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 13 (Leiden: Brill, 2004).

Barraclough, G., *The Crucible of Europe: The Ninth and Tenth Centuries in European History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976).

Bartlett, R., *The Making of Europe: Conquest, Colonization, and Cultural Change, 950–1350* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993).

Baumgartner, E. (ed.), *Le nombre du temps: En hommage à Paul Zumthor* (Paris: Champion Slatkin, 1988).

Bautier, R.-H., 'Sacres et couronnements sous les carolingiens et les premiers capétiens: Recherches sur la genèse du sacre royale français', *Annuaire-bulletin de la Société de l'histoire de France* (1987): 7–56.

Benson, R. L., and Constable, G. (eds.), *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century* (Cambridge, MA.: Harvard University Press, 1982).

Biddle, M., 'The Development of the Anglo-Saxon Town', in *Topografia urbana e vita cittadina nell'alto medioevo in occidente, 26 aprile - 1 maggio, 1973*. 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 21 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1974), vol. 1, 203–30, esp. 204 and 228–30.

Bisson, T. N., *The Crisis of the Twelfth Century: Power, Lordship, and the Origins of European Government* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2009).

Blair, J., *The Church in Anglo-Saxon Society* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).

Blair, J., 'Introduction: From Minster to Parish Church', in J. Blair (ed.), *Minsters and Parish Churches: The Local Church in Transition, 950–1050*, Oxford University Committee for Archaeology Monograph, vol. 17 (Oxford: Oxford University Committee for Archaeology, 1988), 1–19.

Blair, J. (ed.), *Minsters and Parish Churches: The Local Church in Transition, 950–1050*, Oxford University Committee for Archaeology Monograph, vol. 17 (Oxford: Oxford University Committee for Archaeology, 1988).

Blair, J., and Sharpe, R. (eds.), *Pastoral Care before the Parish* (Leicester: Leicester University Press, 1992).

Bloch, M., *Feudal Society*, trans. L. A. Manyon, 2 vols. (original 1939, 1940; Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961).

Blumenthal, U.-R., *The Investiture Controversy: Church and Monarchy from the Ninth to the Twelfth Century* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988).

Bonnassie, P., 'Le clergé paroissial aux IXe-Xe siècles dans les Pyréneées orientales et centrales', in Bonnassie, *Le clergé rural dans l'Europe médiévale et moderne (Actes des XIIIe Journées Internationales d'histoire de Flaran* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 1995), 153–66 and 269–83; repr. with comments and a "Bibliographie complémentaire" in Bonnassie, *Les Sociétés de l'an mil: Un monde entre deux âges* (Brussels: De Boeck & Larcier, 2001), 269-83.

Bonnassie, P., 'La croissance agricole du haut Moyen Âge dans la Gaule du Midi et le Nord-est de la Péninsule ibérique: chronologie, modalités, limites', in *La croissance agricole: Chronologie, modalités, géographie. Centre culturel de l'Abbaye de Flaran: Dixièmes journées internationales d'histoire, 9, 10, 11 septembre 1988*, Flaran, vol. 10 (Auch: Comité départemental de tourisme du Gers, 1990), 13–35; repr. with some comments and a "Bibliographie complémentaire" in Bonnassie, *Sociétés de l'an mil: Un monde entre deux âges* (Brussels: De Boeck & Larcier, 2001), 169–97.

Bonnassie, P., *Les Sociétés de l'an mil; Un monde entre deux âges* (Brussels: De Boeck & Larcier, 2001).

Bonnassie, P. (ed.), *Le clergé rural dans l'Europe médiévale et moderne (Actes des XIIIe Journées Internationales d'histoire de Flaran* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 1995).

Bonnassie, P., and Toubert, P. (eds.), *Hommes et sociétés dans l'Europe de l'an mil* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 2004).

Bordone, R., 'La città nel secolo X', in *Il Secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19–25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1999, vol. 1), 517–53.

Bouchard, C. B., 'Merovingian, Carolingian, and Cluniac Monasticism: Reform and Renewal in Burgundy', *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 41 (1990): 365–88.

Bougard, F., 'Actes privés et transferts patrimoniaux en Italie centro-septentrionale (VIIIe-Xe siècle)', in *Les transferts patrimoniaux en Europe occidentale, VIIIme-Xme siècle (I).Actes de la table ronde de Rome, 6, 7 et 8 mai 1999, Mélanges de l'École française de Rome – moyen âge*, 3 (1999): 539–62.

Brown, G. H., 'The Anglo-Saxon Monastic Revival', in W. Treadgold (ed.), *Renaissances before the Renaissance: Cultural Revivals of Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1984), 99–113.

Buc, P., *The Dangers of Ritual: Between Early Medieval Texts and Social Scientific Theory* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001).

Buc, P., 'Political Rituals and Political Imagination in the Medieval West from the Fourth Century to the Eleventh', in P. Linehan, and J. Nelson (eds.), *Medieval World* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 189–213.

Bullough, D. A., *Carolingian Renewal: Sources and Heritage* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1991).

Bullough, D. A., 'The Continental Background of the Tenth-Century English Reform', in D. Parsons (ed.), *Tenth-Century Studies: Essays in Commemoration of the Millennium of the Council of Winchester and Regularis Concordia* (London: Phillimore, 1975), 20–36 and 210–14, repr. in Bullough, *Carolingian Renewal: Sources and Heritage* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1991), 272–96.

Bullough, D. A., 'Texts, Chant, and the Chapel of Louis the Pious', in P. Godman, and R. Collins (eds.), *Charlemagne's Heir: New Perspectives on the Reign of Louis the Pious* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990), 489–508, repr. in Bullough, *Carolingian Renewal: Sources and Heritage* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1991), 241–71.

Campbell, J., *Essays in Anglo-Saxon History* (London: Hambledon Press, 1986).

Campbell, J., 'Observations on English Government from the Tenth to the Twelfth Century', *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 5th ser., 25 (1975): 39–54, repr. in his *Essays in Anglo-Saxon History*, 155–70.

Cheyette, F., 'The Origins of European Villages and the First European Expansion', *The Journal of Economic History*, 37 (1977): 182–206.

Christie, N. (ed.), *Landscapes of Change: Rural Evolutions in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 2004).

Colardelle, M., and Verdel, É., 'Les sociétés de l'An Mil: Quelques apports et questionnements de l'archéologie', in P. Bonnassie, and P. Toubert (eds.), *Hommes et Sociétés dans l'Europe de l'an mil* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 2004), 31–72.

Constable, G., 'Cluny in the Monastic World of the Tenth Century', in *Il Secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19–25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), 391–448.

Constable, G., Melville, G., and Oberste, J. (eds.), *Die Cluniazenser in ihrem politisch-sozialen Umfeld*, Vita Regularis, vol. 7 (Munich: LIT Verlag, 1998).

La croissance agricole du Haut Moyen Âge: Chronologie, modalités, géographie. Centre culturel de l'Abbaye de Flaran: Dixièmes journées internationales d'histoire, 9, 10, 11 septembre 1988, Flaran, vol. 10 (Auch: Comité départemental de tourisme du Gers, 1990).

Cubitt, C., 'The Tenth-Century Benedictine Reform in England', *Early Medieval Europe*, 6 (1997): 77–94.

Cubitt, C. (ed.), *Court Culture in the Early Middle Ages: The Proceedings of the First Alcuin Conference* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003).

La cultura antica nell'Occidente latino dal VII all'XI secolo: 18–24 aprile 1974, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 22 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1975).

Curta, F., 'Iron Century or Golden Age (900–1000)', in F. Curta (ed.), *Southeastern Europe in the Middle Ages, 500–1250* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 178–247.

Curta, F. (ed.), *East Central & Eastern Europe in the Early Middle Ages* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005).

Davis, J. R., and McCormick, M. (eds.), *The Long Morning of Medieval Europe: New Directions in Early Medieval Studies* (Aldershot, UK: Ashgate, 2008).

Davis, J. R., and McCormick M., 'The Early Middle Ages: Europe's Long Morning', in J. R. Davis, and M. McCormick (eds.), *The Long Morning of Medieval Europe: New Directions in Early Medieval Studies* (Aldershot: UK, Ashgate, 2008), 1–10.

Delogu, P., 'The Rebirth of Rome in the 8th and 9th Centuries', in R. Hodges, and B. Hobley (eds.), *The Rebirth of Towns in the West, AD 700–1050*, Council for British Archaeology Research Report, vol. 68 (London: CBA, 1960), 32–42.

Duby, G., *Rural Economy and Country Life in the Medieval West*, trans C. Postan (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1968).

Duby, G., *The Early Growth of the European Economy*, trans. H. B. Clarke (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1974).

Duggan, A. J. (ed.), *Nobles and Nobility in Medieval Europe: Concepts, Origins, Transformations* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: The Boydell Press, 2000).

Dumas, F., 'La monnaie au Xe siècle', in *Il secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19–25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), vol. 2, 564–614.

Dumas, F., *Le trésor de Fécamp et le monnayage en France occidentale pendant la seconde moitié du Xe siècle* (Paris: Bibliothèque nationale, 1971).

Dunbabin, J., 'West Francia: The Kingdom', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 372–97.

Durand, A., 'Les milieux naturels autour de l'An Mil: Approches paléoenvironnementales méditerranéennes', in P. Bonnassie, and P. Toubert (eds.), *Hommes et Sociétés dans l'Europe de l'an mil* (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du mirail, 2004), 73–100.

Durliat, J., *Les finances publiques de Dioclétien aux Carolingiens (284–889)* (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke, 1990).

Dyer, C., 'Medieval Farming and Technology: Conclusion', in G. Astill, and J. Langdon (eds.), *Medieval Farming and Technology: The Impact of Agricultural Change in Northwest Europe*, Technology and Change in History, vol. 1 (Leiden: Brill, 1997), 294–312.

Ehlers, J., 'Dom- und Klosterschulen in Deutschland und Frankreich im 10. und 11. Jahrhundert', in M. Kintzinger, S. Lorenz, and M. Walter (eds.), *Schule und Schüler im Mittelalter: Beiträge zur europäischen Bildungsgeschichte des 9. bis 15. Jahrhunderts*, Beihefte zum Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, vol. 42 (Cologne: Böhlau, 1996), 29–59.

Ehlers, J., *Charlemagne, l'Européen entre la France et l'Allemagne: Bibliothèque historique de la Ville de Paris, le 6 octobre 2000*, Conférences annuelles de l'Institut historique allemand, vol. 7 (Stuttgart: Jan Thorbecke, 2001).

Fleckenstein, J., 'Königshof und Bischofsschule unter Otto dem Grossen', *Archiv für Kulturgeschichte*, 38 (1956): 38–62, repr. in Fleckenstein, *Ordnungen und formende Kräfte des Mittelalters: Ausgewählte Beiträge* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1989), 168–92.

Font, M., 'Missions, Conversions, and Power Legitimization in East Central Europe at the Turn of the First Millennium', in F. Curta (ed.), *East Central & Eastern Europe in the Early Middle Ages* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005), 283–96.

Fossier, R., *Enfance de l'Europe: X^e-XIIe siècle. Aspects économiques et sociaux*, 2 vols. (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1982).

Fossier, R., 'Rural Economy and Country Life', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999): 27–63.

Fossier, R., 'Les tendances de l'économie: Stagnation ou croissance?', *Nascita dell'Europa ed Europa carolingia: Un'equazione da verificare*, Settimane di Studi del Centro Italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 27 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1981), 261–90.

Fouracre, P., and Ganz, D. (eds.), *Frankland: The Franks and the World of the Early Middle Ages: Essays in Honour of Dame Jinty Nelson* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2008).

Fowler, P., *Farming in the First Millennium AD: British Agriculture between Julius Caesar and William the Conqueror* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

Fox, R. (ed.), *Technological Change: Methods and Themes in the History of Technology* (Amsterdam: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1996).

Francovich, R., 'The Beginnings of Hilltop Villages in Early Medieval Tuscany', in J. R. Davis, and M. McCormick (eds.), *Long Morning of Medieval Europe: New Directions in Early Medieval Studies* (Aldershot, UK, Ashgate, 2008), 55–82.

Gabriele, M., and Stuckey J. (eds.), *The Legend of Charlemagne in the Middle Ages: Power, Faith, and Crusade* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008).

Garipzanov, I. H., Geary, P. J., and Urbańczyk, P. (eds.), *Franks, Northmen, and Slavs: Identities and State Formation in Early Medieval Europe*, Cursor mundi, vol. 5 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008).

Geary, P. J., 'Monastic Memory and the Mutation of the Year Thousand', in S. Farmer, and B. H. Rosenwein (eds.), *Monks and Nuns, Saints and Outcasts: Religion in Medieval Society. Essays in Honor of Lester K. Little* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2000), 19–36.

Geary, P. J., 'Oblivion between Orality and Textuality in the Tenth Century', in G. Althoff, et al. (eds.), *Medieval Concepts of the Past: Ritual, Memory, Historiography* (Washington, DC: German Historical Institute, 2002), 111–122.

Geary, P. J., *Phantoms of Remembrance: Memory and Oblivion at the End of the First Millennium* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994).

Godman, P., and Collins R. (eds.), *Charlemagne's Heir: New Perspectives on the Reign of Louis the Pious* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990).

Hall, B., 'Lynn White's *Medieval Technology and Social Change* after Thirty Years', in R. Fox (ed.), *Technological Change: Methods and Themes in the History of Technology* (Amsterdam: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1996), 85–101.

Hallinger, K., *Gorze-Kluny. Studien zu den monastischen Lebensformen und Gegensätzen im Hochmittelalter*, 2 vols. Studia Anselmiana, vols. 22–25 (Rome: Herder, 1950–1951).

Hamerow, H., *Early Medieval Settlements: The Archaeology of Rural Communities in North-West Europe, 400–900* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).

Hartmann, W. (ed.), *Bischof Burchard von Worms, 1000–1025*, Quellen und Abhandlungen zur mittelrheinischen Kirchengeschichte, vol. 100 (Mainz: Selbsverlag der Gesellschaft für Mittelrheinische Kirchengeschichte, 2000).

Haskins, C. H., *The Renaissance of the Twelfth Century* (1926, repr. Cambridge, MA.: Harvard University Press, 1955).

Hen, Y. *Roman Barbarians: The Royal Court and Culture in the Early Medieval West* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007).

Hen, Y., *The Royal Patronage of Liturgy in Frankish Gaul to the Death of Charles the Bald*, Henry Bradshaw Society Subsidia, vol. 3 (London: Boydell Press, 2001).

Hendy, M. F., 'East and West: Divergent Models of Coinage and its Use', in *Il secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19–25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), vol. 2, 637–79.

Henning, J., 'Slavery or Freedom? The Causes of Early Medieval Europe's Economic Advancement', *Early Medieval Europe*, 12 (2003): 269–77.

Henning, J., 'Strong Rulers –Weak Economy? Rome, the Carolingians and the Archaeology of Slavery in the First Millennium AD', in J. R. Davis and M. McCormick (eds.), *Long Morning of Medieval Europe: New Directions in Early Medieval Studies* (Aldershot, UK, Ashgate, 2008), 33–53.

Herlihy, D., 'Church Property on the European Continent, 701–1200', *Speculum*, 36 (1961): 81–105.

Hlawitschka, E., *Vom Frankenreich zur Formierung der europäischen Staaten- und Völkergemeinschaft, 840–1046: Ein Studienbuch zur Zeit der späten Karolinger, der Ottonen und der frühen Salier in der Geschichte Mitteleuropas* (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1986).

Hodges, R., *Dark Age Economics: The Origins of Towns and Trade, A.D. 600–1000* (New York: St Martin's Press, 1982).

Hodges, R., 'Dark Age Economics Revisited', in H. Sarfati, et al. (eds.), *Discussion with the Past: Archaeological Studies Presented to W. A. van Es* (Zwolle: ROB, 1999), 227–32, repr. in Hodges, *Goodbye to the Vikings? Re-reading Early Medieval Archaeology* (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co., 2006), 63–71.

Hodges, R., *Goodbye to the Vikings? Re-reading Early Medieval Archaeology* (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co., 2006).

Hodges, R., *Light in the Dark Ages: The Rise and Fall of San Vincenzo al Volturno* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1997).

Hodges, R., 'Society, Power and the First English Industrial Revolution', in *Il secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19-25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), vol. 1, 125–57.

Hodges, R., *Towns and Trade in the Age of Charlemagne* (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co., 2000).

Hodges, R., and Hobley B. (eds.), *The Rebirth of Towns in the West, AD 700–1050*, Council for British Archaeology Research Report, vol. 68 (London: CBA, 1960).

Howe, J., 'The Nobility's Reform of the Medieval Church', *American Historical Review*, 93 (1988): 317–39.

Howe, J., 'Re-Forging the 'Age of Iron': Part I: The Tenth Century as the End of the Ancient World?', *History Compass*, vol. 8 (2010): 866–87.

Hummer, H. J., *Politics and Power in Early Medieval Europe: Alsace and the Frankish Realm, 600–1000*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th ser., vol. 65 (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2005).

Innes, M., '"A Place of Discipline": Carolingian Courts and Aristocratic Youth', in C. Cubitt (ed.), *Court Culture in the Early Middle Age: The Proceedings of the First Alcuin Conference* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003), 59–76.

Innes, M., *State and Society in the Early Middle Ages: The Middle Rhine Valley, 400–1000*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th ser., vol. 47 (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000).

Iogna-Prat, D., *Études clunisiennes* (Paris: Picard, 2002).

Iogna-Prat, D., and Picard J. C. (eds.), *Religion et culture autour de l'an Mil. Royaume capétien et Lotharingie: Actes du Colloque Hugues Capet 987–1987, la France de l'an Mil, Auxerre, 26 et 27 juin 1987 – Metz, 11 et 12 septembre 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1990).

Jackson, R. A., 'General Introduction', *Ordines Coronationis Franciae: Texts and Ordines for the Coronation of Frankish and French Kings and Queens in the Middle Ages*, 2 vols. (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995 and 2000), vol. 1, 21–30.

Jaeger, C. S., *The Envy of Angels: Cathedral Schools and Social Ideals in Medieval Europe, 950–1200* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994).

Johanek, P., 'Merchants, Markets and Towns', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 64–94, esp. 66–9.

Keynes, S., 'England, 900–1016', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999): 456–84.

Kintzinger, M., Lorenz, S., and Walter, M. (eds.), *Schule und Schüler im Mittelalter: Beiträge zur europäischen Bildungsgeschichte des 9. bis 15. Jahrhunderts*, Beihefte zum Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, vol. 42 (Cologne: Bohlau, 1996).

Kottje, R., and Maurer, H. (eds.), *Monastische Reformen im 9. und 10. Jahrhundert*, Vorträge und Forschungen, vol. 38 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke Verlag, 1989).

Krautheimer, R., *Rome: Profile of a City, 312–1308* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1980).

Lapidge, M., 'Schools, Learning and Literature in Tenth-Century England', in *Il Secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19–25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), vol. 2, 951–1005.

La Rocca, C., 'Perceptions of an Early Medieval Urban Landscape', in P. Linehan, and J. Nelson (eds.), *The Medieval World* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 416–31.

Le Goff, J., *The Birth of Europe*, trans. J. Lloyd (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005).

Le istituzioni ecclesiastiche della Societas Christiana dei secoli XI-XII: Diocesi, pievi e parrocchie: Atti della sesta Settimana internazionale di studio, Milano, 1–7 settembre 1974, Pubblicazioni dell'Universita' cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Miscellanea del Centro di studi medioevali, vol. 8 (Milan: Vita e Pensiero, 1977).

Le Jan, R., 'Continuity and Change in the Tenth-Century Nobility', in A. J. Duggan (ed.), *Nobles and Nobility in Medieval Europe: Concepts, Origins, Transformations* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: The Boydell Press, 2000), 53–68.

Le Jan, R., 'Frankish Giving of Arms and Rituals of Power: Continuity and Change in the Carolingian Period', in F. Theuws, and J. Nelson (eds.), *Rituals of Power: From Late Antiquity to the Early Middle Ages*, The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 8 (Leiden: Brill, 2000), 281–309.

Le Jan, R., 'Le Royaume franc vers 900: Un pouvoir en mutation?', in P. Baudouin (ed.), *Les fondations scandinaves en Occident et les débuts du duché de Normandie: Colloque de Cerisy-la-Salle (25–29 septembre 2002)* (Caen: Publications du CRAHM, 2005), 83–95.

Leonardi, C., 'Intellectual Life', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999): 186–211.

Leyser, K., *Communications and Power in Medieval Europe*, T. Reuter (ed.), 2 vols. (London: Hambledon Press, 1994).

Leyser, K., 'The German Aristocracy from the Ninth to the Early Twelfth Century: A Historical and Cultural Sketch', *Past & Present*, 41 (1968): 25–53.

Leyser, K., 'Ritual, Ceremony, and Gesture: Ottonian Germany', in K. Leyser (ed.), *Communications and Power in Medieval Europe*, ed. T. Reuter, 2 vols. (London: Hambledon Press, 1994), vol. 1, 189–213.

Leyser, K., *Rule and Conflict in an Early Medieval Society: Ottonian Saxony* (London: Arnold, 1979).

Leyser, K., 'Sacral Kingship', in *Rule and Conflict in an Early Medieval Society: Ottonian Saxony* (London: Arnold, 1979), 75–107.

Linehan, P., and Nelson, J. (eds.), *The Medieval World* (New York: Routledge, 2001).

Lopez, R. S., *The Commercial Revolution of the Middle Ages, 950–1350* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1976).

Loyn, H. R., 'Church and State in England in the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries', in D. Parsons (ed.), *Tenth-Century Studies: Essays in Commemoration of the Millennium of the Council of Winchester and Regularis Concordia* (London: Phillimore, 1975), 94–102 and 229–30.

Lutz, C. E., *Schoolmasters of the Tenth Century* (Hamden, CT: Archon Books, 1977).

MacLean, S., 'Making a Difference in Tenth-Century Politics: King Athelstan's Sisters and Frankish Queenship', in P. Fouracre and D. Ganz (eds.), *Frankland: The Franks and the World of the Early Middle Ages: Essays in Honour of Dame Jinty Nelson* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2008), 167–90.

Mâle, E., *The Gothic Image: Religious Art in France of the Thirteenth Century*, trans. D. Nussey (New York: Harper, 1958).

McCormick, M., 'Liturgie et guerre des Carolingiens à la première croisade', in *"Militia Christi" e Crociata nei secoli XI-XIII: Atti della undecima Settimana internazionale di studio, Mendola, 1989, 28 agosto - 1 settembre 1989*, Miscellanea del Centro di studi medioevali, vol. 13 (Milan: Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, 1992), 209–40.

McCormick, M., *Origins of the European Economy: Communications and Commerce, A.D. 300–900* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001).

McCormick, M., Dutton, P. E., and Mayewski, P. A., 'Volcanoes and the Climate Forcing of Carolingian Europe, A.D. 750–950', *Speculum*, 82 (2007): 865–95.

McKitterick, R., *Charlemagne: The Formation of a European Identity* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008).

McKitterick, R., 'The Church', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 130–62.

McKitterick, R., 'Continuity and Innovation in Tenth-Century Ottonian Culture', in L. Smith, and B. Ward (eds.), *Intellectual Life in the Middle Ages: Essays Presented to Margaret Gibson* (London: The Hambledon Press, 1992), 15–24.

McKitterick, R., *The Frankish Kingdoms under the Carolingians, 751–987* (London: Longman, 1983).

'Militia Christi' e Crociata nei secoli XI-XIII: Atti della undecima Settimana internazionale di studio, Mendola, 1989, 28 agosto – 1 settembre 1989, Miscellanea del Centro di studi medioevali, vol. 13 (Milan: Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, 1992).

Moore, R. I., *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Power and Deviance in Western Europe, 950–1250* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1987).

Moran, M., 'San Vincenzo in the Making: The Discovery of an Early Medieval Production Site on the East Bank of the Volturno', in T. Pestell and K. Ulmschneider (eds.), *Markets in Early Medieval Europe: Trading and Productive Sites, 650–850* (Macclesfield, Cheshire: Windgather Press, 2003), 248–63.

Muldoon, J., *Empire and Order: The Concept of Empire, 800–1800* (New York: St Martin's Press, 1999).

Musset, L., *Nordica et Normannica: Recueil d'études sur la Scandinavie ancienne et médiévale, les expéditions des Vikings et la fondation de la Normandie*, Studia nordica, vol. 1 (Paris: Société des études nordiques, 1997).

Musset, L., 'La renaissance urbaine des Xe et XIe siècles dans l'ouest de la France: Problèmes et hypothèses de travail', in *Études de civilisation médiévale, IXe-XIIe siècles: Mélanges offerts à Edmond-René Labande à l'occasion de son départ à la retraite et du XXe anniversaire du C.E.S.C.M.* (Poitiers: C.E.S.C.M, 1974), 563–75, repr. in L. Musset (ed.), *Nordica et Normannica: Recueil d'études sur la Scandinavie ancienne et médiévale, les expéditions des Vikings et la fondation de la Normandie*, Studia nordica, vol.1 (Paris: Société des études nordiques, 1997), 361–76.

Nascita dell'Europa ed Europa carolingia: Un'equazione da verificare, Settimane di studi del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 27 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1981).

NCMH. See New Cambridge Medieval History.

Nelson, J., 'Charlemagne: "Father of Europe"?', *Quaestiones Medii Aevi Novae*, 7 (2002): 3–20, repr. in Nelson, *Courts, Elites, and Gendered Power* [same pagination].

Nelson, J., *Charles the Bald* (London: Longman, 1992).

Nelson, J., *Courts, Elites, and Gendered Power in the Early Middle Ages: Charlemagne and Others*, Variorum Collected Studies Series, vol. 878 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2007).

Nelson, J., 'Early Medieval Rites of Queen-Making and the Shaping of Medieval Queenship', in A. J. Duggan (ed.), *Queens and Queenship in Medieval Europe* (Woodbridge, UK: Boydell, 1997), 301–15, repr. in Nelson, *Rulers and Ruling Families in Early Medieval Europe*, Variorum Collected Studies Series, vol. 657 (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 1999) [same pagination].

Nelson, J., 'Frankish Identity in Charlemagne's Empire', in I. H. Garipzanov, P. J. Geary and P. Urbańczyk (eds.), *Franks, Northmen, and Slavs: Identities and State Formation in Early Medieval Europe*, Cursor mundi, vol. 5 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008), 71–83.

Nelson, J., 'Hincmar of Reims on King-making: The Evidence of the Annals of St. Bertin, 861–882', in J. M. Bak (ed.), *Coronations: Medieval and Early Modern Monarchic Ritual* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990), 16–34.

Nelson, J., 'Kingship and Royal Government', in *NCMH*, vol. 2 (1995), 383–430.

Nelson, J., *Rulers and Ruling Families in Early Medieval Europe*, Variorum Collected Studies Series, vol. 657 (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 1999).

Nelson, J., 'Was Charlemagne's Court a Courtly Society?', in I. C. Cubitt (eds.), *Court Culture in the Early Middle Ages: The Proceedings of the First Alcuin Conference* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003), 39–57, repr. in Nelson, *Courts, Elites, and Gendered Power: Charlemagne and Others*, Variorum Collected Studies Series, vol. 878 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2007) [same pagination].

New Cambridge Medieval History, The [*NCMH*]. 8 vols. (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1995–2005).

Nightingale, J., *Monasteries and Patrons in the Gorze Reform: Lotharingia c. 850–1000* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2001).

Olson, L., *The Early Middle Ages: The Birth of Europe* (New York: Macmillan Palgrave, 2007).

Parisse, M., 'Noblesse et monastères en Lotharingie du IXe au XIe siècle', in R. Kottje and H. Maurer (eds.), *Monastische Reformen im 9. und 10. Jahrhundert*, Vorträge und Forschungen, vol. 38 (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke Verlag, 1989), 167–96.

Parisse, M., 'Princes laïques et/ou moines, les évêques du Xe siècle', in *Il Secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19-25 aprile 1990*, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991), vol. 1, 449–516.

Parisse, M., and Barral i Altet, X. (eds.), *Le Roi de France et son Royaume autour de l'an mil: Actes du colloque Hugues Capet 987–1987, La France de l'an Mil, Paris – Senlis, 22–25 juin 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1992).

Parsons, D. (ed.), *Tenth-Century Studies: Essays in Commemoration of the Millennium of the Council of Winchester and Regularis Concordia* (London: Phillimore, 1975).

Périn, P., 'The Origin of the Village in Early Medieval Gaul', in N. Christie (ed.), *Landscapes of Change: Rural Evolutions in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 2004): 255–78.

Périn, P., 'La part du Haut Moyen Âge dans la genèse des terroirs de la France médiévale', in M. Parisse, and X. Barral i Altet (eds.), *Le Roi de France et son Royaume autour de l'an mil: Actes du colloque Hugues Capet 987-1987, La France de l'an Mil, Paris–Senlis, 22–25 juin 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1992): 225–33.

Pestell, T., and Ulmschneider, K. (eds.), *Markets in Early Medieval Europe: Trading and Productive Sites, 650–850* (Macclesfield, Cheshire: Windgather Press, 2003).

Pichot, D., 'Le village, une nouveauté?', in *Le Village éclaté: Habitat et société dans les campagnes de l'Ouest au Moyen Âge* (Rennes: Presses universitaires de Rennes, 2002), 59–112.

Pirenne, H., *Medieval Cities: Their Origins and the Revival of Trade*, trans. F. D. Halsey (1925, repr. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1958).

Radding, C. M., 'The Geography of Learning in Early Eleventh-Century Europe: Lanfranc of Bec and Berengar of Tours Revisited', *Bullettino dell'Istituto storico italiano per il Medio Evo*, 98 (1992): 145–72.

Raepsaet, G., 'The Development of Farming Implements between the Seine and the Rhine from the Second to the Twelfth Centuries', in G. Astill, and J. Langdon (eds.), *Medieval Farming and Technology: The Impact of Agricultural Change in Northwest Europe*, Technology and Change in History, vol. 1 (Leiden: Brill, 1997), 41–68.

Redman, C. L. (ed.), *Medieval Archaeology: Papers of the Seventeenth Annual Conference of the Center for Medieval and Early Renaissance Studies*, Medieval & Renaissance Texts & Studies, vol. 60 (Binghamton, NY: SUNY, 1989).

Reigniez, P., 'Histoire et techniques: L'outil agricole dans la periode du Haut Moyen Âge', in M. Barceló and F. Sigaut, *The Making of Feudal Agricultures?* The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 13 (Leiden: Brill, 2004), 33–120.

Reuter, T., *Germany in the Early Middle Ages, c. 800–1056* (London: Longman, 1991).

Reuter, T., 'The "Imperial Church System" of the Ottonian and Salian Rulers: A Reconsideration', *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 33 (1982): 347–74, repr. in T. Reuter, *Medieval Polities and Modern Mentalities*, ed. J. L. Nelson (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 325–54.

Reuter, T., 'The Making of England and Germany, 850–1050: Points of Comparison and Difference', in A. P. Smyth (ed.), *Medieval Europeans*, 53–70; repr. in Reuter, *Medieval Polities and Modern Mentalities*, ed. J. L. Nelson (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 284–99.

Reuter, T., *Medieval Polities and Modern Mentalities*, ed. J. L. Nelson (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006).

Reuter, T., 'The Ottonians and Carolingian Tradition', in T. Reuter (ed.), *Medieval Polities and Modern Mentalities*, ed. J. L. Nelson (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 268–83.

Reuter, T. (ed.), *NCMH*, vol. 3: c. 900–c.1024 (Cambridge UK: Cambridge University Press, 1999).

Reynolds, S., *Fiefs and Vassals: The Medieval Evidence Reinterpreted* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994).

Riché, P., *The Carolingians: A Family Who Forged Europe*, trans. M. I. Allen (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1993).

Riché, P., *Education et Culture dans l'Occident médiéval*, Collected Studies Series, vol. 420 (Aldershot, Hampshire: Variorum, 1993).

Riché, P., 'Essor des écoles occidentales: Milieux X^e – milieu XIe siècle', in *Écoles et enseignement dans le haut moyen âge: Fin du Ve siècle-milieu du XIe siècle* (Paris: Aubier Montaigne, 1979), 119–36.

Riché, P., *Instruction et vie religieuse dans le Haut Moyen Age*, Collected Studies, vol. 139 (London: Variorum Reprints, 1981).

Riché, P., 'Les lettrés du Xe siècle et l'histoire de Rome', in E. Baumgartner (ed.), *Le nombre du temps: En hommage à Paul Zumthor* (Paris: Champion Slatkin, 1988), 115–23, repr. in Riché, *Education and Culture dans l'Occident médiéval*, Collected Studies Series, vol. 420 (Aldershot, Hampshire: Variorum, 1993) [same pagination].

Riché, P., 'La 'Renaissance' intellectuelle du Xe siècle en Occident', *Cahiers d'histoire*, 21 (1976): 27–42, repr. in Riché, *Instruction et vie religieuse dans le Haut Moyen Age*, Collected Studies, vol. 139 (London: Variorum Reprints, 1981), [same pagination].

Roland, A., 'Once More into the Stirrups: Lynn White Jr., *Medieval Technology and Social Change*', *Technology and Culture*, 44 (2003): 574–85.

Rommelaere, C., and Raepsaet, G., 'Les techniques de traction animale de l'Antiquité au Moyen Âge', in M. Barceló and F. Sigaut (eds.), *The Making of Feudal Agricultures?* The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 13 (Leiden: Brill, 2004), 121–30.

Rosenwein, B. H., *Rhinoceros Bound: Cluny in the Tenth Century* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1982).

Rosenwein, B. H., *To Be the Neighbor of Saint Peter: The Social Meaning of Cluny's Property, 909–1049* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1989).

Rosser, G., 'The Cure of Souls in English Towns before 1000', in J. Blair and R. Sharpe (eds.), *Pastoral Care before the Parish* (Leicester: Leicester University Press, 1992), 267–84.

Rouche, M., 'The Vikings versus the Towns of Northern Gaul: Challenge and Response', in C. L. Redman (ed.), *Medieval Archaeology: Papers of the Seventeenth Annual Conference of the Center for Medieval and Early Renaissance Studies*, Medieval & Renaissance Texts & Studies, vol. 60 (Binghamton, NY: SUNY, 1989), 41–56.

Russo, D. G., *Town Origins and Development in Early England, c. 400–950 A.D.* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1998).

Sarfati, H., Verwers, W. J. H., and Woltering, P. J. (eds.), *Discussion with the Past: Archaeological Studies Presented to W. A. van Es* (Zwolle: ROB, 1999).

Sawyer, P. H., and Hilton, R. H., 'Technical Determinism: The Stirrup and the Plough', *Past & Present*, 24 (1963): 90–100.

Il Secolo di ferro: Mito e realtà del secolo X, 19–25 aprile 1990, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 38 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1991).

Smith, B., Wolfe, M. (eds.), *Technology and Resource Use in Medieval Europe: Cathedrals, Mills, and Mines* (Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 1997).

Smith, J. A., 'The Earliest Queen-Making Rites', *Church History*, 66 (1997): 18–35.

Smith, L., and Ward, B. (eds.), *Intellectual Life in the Middle Ages: Essays Presented to Margaret Gibson* (London: The Hambledon Press, 1992).

Smyth, A. P. (ed.), *Medieval Europeans: Studies in Ethnic Identity and National Perspectives in Medieval Europe* (London: Macmillan Press, 1998).

Southern, R. W., *The Making of the Middle Ages* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953).

Staub, J., 'Domschulen am Mittelrhein um und nach 1000', in W. Hartmann (ed.), *Bischof Burchard von Worms, 1000-1025*, Quellen und Abhandlungen zur mittelrheinischen Kirchengeschichte, vol. 100 (Mainz: Selbsverlag der Gesellschaft für mittelrheinische Kirchengeschichte, 2000), 279–309.

Strayer, J. R., *On the Medieval Origins of the Modern State* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1970).

Sullivan, R. E., 'The Carolingian Age: Reflections on Its Place in the History of the Middle Ages', *Speculum*, 64 (1989): 267–306.

Theuws, F., and Nelson, J. (eds.), *Rituals of Power: From Late Antiquity to the Early Middle Ages*, The Transformation of the Roman World, vol. 8 (Leiden: Brill, 2000).

Tilliette, J.-Y., 'Le Xe siècle dans l'histoire de la littérature', in D. Iogna-Prat and J. C. Picard (eds.), *Religion et culture autour de l'an Mil. Royaume capétien et Lotharingie: Actes du Colloque Hugues Capet 987-1987, la France de l'an Mil, Auxerre, 26 et 27 juin 1987 – Metz, 11 et 12 septembre 1987* (Paris: Picard, 1990), 93–8.

Topografia urbana e vita cittadina nell'alto medioevo in occidente, 26 aprile – 1 maggio, 1973, 2 vols., Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, vol. 21 (Spoleto: CISAM, 1974).

Toubert, P., *L'Europe dans sa première croissance: De Charlemagne à l'an mil* (Paris: Fayard, 2004).

Toubert, P., 'Le part du grand domaine dans le décollage économique de l'Occident (VIIIe-Xe siècles)', in *La croissance agricole du Haut Moyen Âge: Chronologie, modalitées, géographie. Centre culturel de l'Abbaye de Flaran: Dixièmes journées internationales d'histoire, 9, 10, 11 septembre 1988*, Flaran, vol. 10 (Auch: Comité départemental de tourisme du Gers, 1990), 53–86.

Treadgold, W. (ed.), *Renaissances before the Renaissance: Cultural Revivals of Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1984).

Ulmschneider, K., and Pestell, T., 'Introduction: Early Medieval Markets and "Productive" Sites', in T. Pestell, and K. Ulmschneider (eds.), *Markets in Early Medieval Europe: Trading and Productive Sites, 650-850* (Macclesfield, Cheshire: Windgather Press, 2003), 1–10.

Urbańczyk, P. (ed.), *Europe around the Year 1000* (Warsaw: Polish Academy of Sciences Institute of Archaeology and Ethnology, 2001).

Van Houts, E., *Memory and Gender in Medieval Europe, 900–1300* (London: MacMillan, 1999).

Verhulst, A., *The Carolingian Economy* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

Verhulst, A., *The Rise of Cities in North-West Europe*, Themes in International Urban History, vol. 4 (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1999).

Wallace-Hadrill, J. M., *The Frankish Church* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1983).

Walsh, J. J., *The Thirteenth, Greatest of Centuries* (New York: Fordham University Press, 1943).

White, L. Jr, *Medieval Technology and Social Change* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1962).

Wickham, C., *Framing the Middle Ages: Europe and the Mediterranean, 400–800* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).

Wickham, C., 'Rethinking the Structure of the Early Medieval Economy', in J. R. Davis, and M. McCormick (eds.), *Long Morning of Medieval Europe: New Directions in Early Medieval Studies* (Aldershot, UK: Ashgate, 2008), 19–31.

Witt, R. G., 'The Landlord and the Economic Revival of the Middle Ages in Northern Europe, 1000–1250', *American Historical Review*, 76 (1971): 965–88.

Wolfe, P., *The Awakening of Europe*, Pelican History of European Thought, vol. 1 (New York: Penguin Books, 1968).

Wolfram, H., 'New Peoples around the Year 1000', in P. Urbańczyk (ed.), *Europe around the Year 1000* (Warsaw: Polish Academy of Sciences Institute of Archaeology and Ethnology, 2001), 391–408.

Wollasch, J., 'Monasticism: The First Wave of Reform', in *NCMH*, vol. 3 (1999), 163–85.

Worthen, S., 'The Influence of Lynn White Jr.'s *Medieval Technology and Social Change*', *History Compass* (30 June, 2009): 1201–17.